



KNOMAD WORKING PAPER 9

Host Society Integration as a Development Vector

A Literature Review

Daniel Cervan-Gil

March 2016



The KNOMAD Working Paper Series disseminates work in progress under the Global Knowledge Partnership on Migration and Development (KNOMAD). A global hub of knowledge and policy expertise on migration and development, KNOMAD aims to create and synthesize multidisciplinary knowledge and evidence; generate a menu of policy options for migration policy makers; and provide technical assistance and capacity building for pilot projects, evaluation of policies, and data collection.

KNOMAD is supported by a multi-donor trust fund established by the World Bank. Germany's Federal Ministry of Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ); Sweden's Ministry of Justice, Migration and Asylum Policy; and the Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation (SDC) are the contributors to the trust fund.

The views expressed in this paper do not represent the views of the World Bank or the sponsoring organizations.

All queries should be addressed to KNOMAD@worldbank.org. KNOMAD working papers and a host of other resources on migration are available at www.KNOMAD.org.

Host Society Integration as a Development Vector

A Literature Review*

Daniel Cervan-Gil†

Abstract

The emergence of migration patterns characterized by circularity, multiple stages, and increased transnational activities has led to new paradigms of integration into the host society that appear promising for development. This review aims to organize the various discussions, debates, and academic literature pertaining to the relationship between migrant integration in the host country and development in the sending country, an under-researched topic in the scholarly literature. A main conclusion is that migration, especially when effectively managed, can benefit both the host and sending countries as well as the migrants themselves. This outcome occurs especially through policies and programs that promote migrants' economic integration, such as language training, credential recognition, progressive access to citizenship rights, antidiscrimination laws, and so on, and also through the migrant's own active engagement in social networks, both within their communities and within mainstream society, in politics, in trade, and in other realms. The literature stresses the importance of transnational networks and associations that share norms, values, beliefs, or understanding in facilitating cooperation between those who emigrate and those who stay in the home country, increasing their potential positive effects on development. To develop new theoretical migration research and policy, however, new data sets (for example, on migrants' multiple migration, rates of return and double-return migrants, the depth of diasporas' transnational linkages beyond remittances, the length of their stay in a given country, and others) are required. Finally, several gaps in the literature that could be further researched are presented.

Keywords: Transnationalism, migrant integration in host society, international migration, social remittances, social capital of migrants, immigrant associations, economic integration, migration and development, knowledge networks.

* This paper was produced for KNOMAD's Thematic Working Group (TWG) on Integration issues in host communities. KNOMAD is headed by Dilip Ratha (World Bank), and the focal point of the TWG on Integration issues in host communities is Hanspeter Wyss (World Bank). Valuable comments were received from Howard Duncan (International Metropolis Project), the previous chair of the TWG on Integration issues in host communities. This paper also reflects comments received from three anonymous external referees through the KNOMAD peer review process, and benefited from copy-editing by Sherrie Brown.

† Daniel Cervan-Gil is Senior Program Officer at the Global Centre for Pluralism, an international research and education center with headquarters in Ottawa, Canada (www.pluralism.ca). The author may be contacted at Daniel.cervan.gil@gmail.com

Table of Contents

Abstract.....	iii
1. Introduction	1
2. Themes and Concepts	2
2.1. Integration	2
2.2. Social Remittances	4
2.3. Social Capital	4
2.4. Human Capital.....	4
2.5. Transnationalism.....	4
2.6. Development	5
3. Key Issues Surrounding Integration in the Host Country as a Development Vector	5
3.1. Acquisition of Human and Social Capital and Development	5
3.1.1. Social Capital, Economic Performance, and Development	6
3.1.2. Language Proficiency, Social Capital, and Development	7
3.1.3. Education, Credential Recognition, and Development	8
3.2. Immigrant Associations and Development.....	9
3.3. Transnational Knowledge Networks and Development.....	11
3.4. Political Integration and Engagement in the Country of Origin	12
4. Case Studies on Integration of Migrants as a Contribution to Development	13
4.1. Germany: Business Network Aachen.....	13
4.2. Europe: Support for Immigrant Entrepreneurs	14
4.3. Canada: Microloans for Immigrant Professionals	14
4.4. Israel: Military Service for Ethiopian Migrants	15
5. Gaps in the Research Literature	15
6. Conclusions	16
7. Annotated Bibliography	17
7.1 Introduction	17
7.2 Migration and Development (Return Migration and Remittances)	18
7.3 Socioeconomic Integration of Migrants	22
7.4 Integration and Development: Transnationalism, Human and Social Capital	25

1. Introduction

The primary goal of this literature review is to organize the various discussions, debates, and academic literature pertaining to the relationship between immigrant integration in the host country and development in the sending country.

This review is structured in four main sections: themes and concepts; analysis of key issues and debates surrounding the links between integration and development; case studies on integration in the Middle East, Europe, and North America; and recommendations to further this area of research.

The academic literature on the effects of migrants' integration in the host country on development in sending countries is not extensive. This review compiles the existing literature and looks into the migration and development literature to extract lessons and new areas of inquiry.

The literature focuses on the processes by which the contributions made by diasporas are made possible. Migrants' engagement in transnational activities enables them to influence the sending and receiving countries simultaneously. The available literature points out that immigrant integration into the host society can actually facilitate and increase transborder activity, contributing to development and vice versa. Transborder activity can lead to better integration outcomes in the host society.

The literature on migration and development has evolved as economic conditions have changed in developing countries. Many scholars, particularly until the 1990s but also after, focused on the "brain drain," whereby migration has a negative impact on sending countries by reducing their human capital, hence constraining development. Scholars that the deeper the integration of migrants into the host society, the fewer remittances they would send, the less likely their return, and the worse the development outcomes would be for the sending country (Adams 1968; Carrington and Detragiache 1998).

More recently, scholars and development agencies have held a more nuanced if not positive view of the links between migration and development, arguing that migration can have a net positive effect in origin countries in certain contexts (Stark and Fan 2007; United Nations 2006; World Bank 2006; Global Commission on Migration and Development 2005; Hugo 2013). They argue that remittances, diaspora, and return migration are the three main contributions of migration to development. The present literature review focuses on the second dimension, that is, diasporas and their level of integration into the host society, as leading to contributions to development in the sending country.

Although it may fall outside the scope of this review, it is necessary to mention the way in which the three types of contribution to development are linked.

First, multiple scholars and development agencies have acknowledged the positive role of remittances for development (for example, de Haas 2005; OECD 2006; Ratha 2013). Indeed, "migrant remittances are generally of higher value than developed countries' aid budgets (Kapur 2005), meaning development assistance may be a useful addition to migration, but no replacement for it" (Barker 2010, 322). But remittances can be a double-edged weapon because "the economies of sending countries may come to

depend increasingly on migrant remittances. Further, in some sending regions, migrants' transfer of resources has resulted in escalating real estate prices, concentration of land tenure in the hands of families connected to migration and increased unemployment" (Faist 2007, 8; Fletcher 1999; Nyberg-Sørensen, Van Hear, and Engberg-Pedersen 2002, 21; Vertovec 2009; Qureshi, Varghese, and Osella 2013). Remittances are also linked to immigrant integration. Economic integration is the *sine qua non* for migrants to be able to remit. However, there is general consensus that remittances are likely to decline over time as migrants become more committed to the country or region of settlement (Hugo 2013).

Second, return migration has been considered a driver for development in that it leads to "brain circulation," as "migrants return enriched with new ideas and skills. In addition, they may invest money earned abroad in their country of origin" (White 2014, 26). But return is not always beneficial because it requires an adequate labor market and functional economic system in the country of origin, as well as specific policies (for example, labor market integration assistance, job fairs, and psychological and social support) on the part of the country of origin (King 2000). Furthermore, with the emergence of transnationalism (see section 3.0.) and the increased numbers of circular migrants and double migrants (that is, migrants that have returned home and migrate again for the second time), the boundaries between return migrants, potential return migrants, and the diaspora are more blurred than ever.

For these reasons, in recent years the research community has begun to explore the attributes acquired through immigrant integration, such as human capital (knowledge, know-how, information, and the like), social capital (networks, interpersonal skills, and so on) and cultural capital (values, political engagement, and others), in a transnational context as important drivers of development. This will be the focus of this literature review; other KNOMAD working groups explore the linkages between remittances and development.

2. Themes and Concepts

2.1. Integration

No agreement on what integration actually is or what constitutes an integrated society has been reached. Some authors stress the political dimension of the integration process. For instance, Bloemraad (2000, 10) argues that integration is mainly a political process of "incorporating newcomers into a democratic process of participation and negotiation that shapes the future, and not about conforming and confining people to pre-established outcomes based on the status quo." Other authors emphasize the social dimension and refer to integration using the concept of "community cohesion," which refers to the "successful development of a shared feeling of belonging amongst both the settled majority and migrant communities and the adherence to common values, moral principles and codes of behavior" (Haverig 2012, 5).

The working definition of integration for this literature review is summarized in the Institute for Strategic Dialogue's definition (ISD 2012, 16), which combines political and socioeconomic aspects and refers to integration as "the tolerance of diversity explicit in multiculturalism, underpinned by legal protection, with

an emphasis upon intercultural contact and social solidarity.” There seems to be consensus in the literature about two aspects of integration.

First, there are three main areas of immigrant integration, comprising social (social relations within and between communities, levels of segregation, level of tolerance between groups, levels of prejudice), economic (income inequality levels, access to education and education performance, access to the labor market), and political integration (antidiscrimination legal frameworks, access to citizenship rights, and others) (ISD 2012). Although these elements are strongly complementary, this review focuses on economic integration.

The available literature stresses how economic integration, particularly fair access to the labor market and productive employment of the highly skilled, ensures full utilization of the migrants’ skills and enhances the human capital of migrants as they acquire new professional skills, learn the new work culture, and connect to peers and networks in their field of expertise. As further discussed in this review, economic integration of highly skilled migrants has been found to have the strongest links to development in the sending country (Raza, Beaujot, and Woldemicael 2012; Schellenberg and Maheux 2009). It must be kept in mind that, ultimately, all three areas—social, economic, political—affect migrants’ economic outcomes.

Second, there is broad agreement in the literature that integration is a two-way process: integration requires multidimensional efforts that are more than merely an aggregate of macro political, cultural, and economic elements. “An enlightened view of integration requires a welcoming attitude towards newcomers on the part of the community, and an equal partnership between newcomers and other members of the community” (Yan and Lauer 2012, 231). Indeed, discrimination and social stigma against new arrivals have a detrimental impact, not only on the migrants’ feelings of belonging, but also on their ability to find suitable employment (Ngan and Chan 2013). As stated in OECD (2013, 192), “discrimination is a key obstacle to the full integration of immigrants and their offspring into the labor market and the society as a whole. It may not only negatively impact on social cohesion and immigrants’ incentives to invest in education and training, but can also represent an economic loss to the host country.”

A final question relates to impact assessment. The immigrant integration literature has long disputed the makeup of a set of normative indicators of successful integration. In this regard, the Migration Policy Group has made important contributions, such as the Migrant Integration Policy Index (MIPEX) in 2004, the second edition in 2007, and the latest edition in 2015.

MIPEX 2015 identifies 167 policy indicators on migrant integration in eight policy areas. “These have been designed to benchmark current laws and policies against the highest standards developed through consultations with top scholars and institutions using and conducting comparative research in their area of expertise.”¹

1. For more information, see <http://www.mipex.eu>

2.2. Social Remittances

Social remittances have been identified as playing a role in community development in the sending country. Levitt (1998, 927) first referred to social remittances as the “ideas, behaviors, identities, and social capital that flow from receiving- to sending-country communities.” In her research, Levitt explores the ways in which those ideas and practices are sent back to the home country and the role they play in transforming the socioeconomic and political life of the home country. Social remittances acquire particular relevance in the transnational perspective of this review. Social remittances permeate the educational practices and living conditions of the communities of origin and thus are key to understanding how migration modifies environments for informal learning (Pitkänen and Takala 2012) and how it contributes to development.

2.3. Social Capital

The social capital of migrants is another aspect of integration that has been addressed in the literature since the 1990s. The Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) defines social capital as “networks together with shared norms, values and understandings that facilitate co-operation within or among groups” (OECD 2001, 41). Researchers have identified two types of social capital. These types are important for the purposes of this review. “Bonding social capital” refers to the relations within homogeneous groups, in this case, ethnic or migrant groups. “Bridging social capital” refers to heterogeneous relationships, ones that exist between groups (Putnam 2000).

2.4. Human Capital

Many definitions of human capital stress individuals’ knowledge accumulation as its key feature (Becker 1975). Taking an economic and labor point of view, Frank and Bernanke (2007, 355) define human capital as “an amalgam of factors such as education, experience, training, intelligence, energy, work habits, trustworthiness, and the initiative that affects the value of a worker’s marginal product.” New approaches to human capital focus on education-related factors as proxies for human capital. A trend in the literature emphasizes that higher human capital points to better integration outcomes for migrants because it enables them to acquire bridging social capital.

2.5. Transnationalism

Transnationalism is a paradigm that replaces unidirectional permanent settlement as the dominant model in international migration (Glick Schiller, Basch, and Blanc-Szanton 1992; Vertovec 2009; Dunn 2005; Hugo 2011). Defenders argue that there is no single unidirectional migration process and that increasing numbers of migrants have overlapping ties to two (or more) countries.

Transnationalism differs from multiple migration in that it does not necessarily entail multiple cross-border movements of migrants. Transnationalism concerns primarily the multistranded social relations that a migrant has and that link together their societies of origin and settlement, or even a third country (Zhou 2013).

Recent research shows that transnational activities and migrants' integration in the host country are neither incompatible nor binary opposites but enjoy a mutually reinforcing relationship (Levitt and Glick Schiller 2008). Furthermore, the literature shows that transnationalism can enhance economic development in the sending country, as discussed later in this review.

2.6. Development

In 1990, the United Nations defined human development—or the human development approach—as a new development paradigm for the international community that goes beyond expanding the richness of the economy in which human beings live to consider the richness of human life.² Following this approach, studies (Davies and Quintilian 2006; Tsai 2006, 2007) use the 1990 United Nations Human Development Index (HDI), which supplements the economic dimension of human welfare (income) with measures of acquired human capital, mainly through education and health considerations (Sanderson 2009).

Some authors stress the controversial nature of the HDI, particularly in this era of economic globalization, for it has failed to provide consistent data. Indeed, discrepancies between economic and human development levels have encouraged researchers to go beyond GDP when studying development.

For these reasons, the existing literature focuses on the economic development effects of migrants' integration. The literature highlights, however, that human and social capital also affect, although less easily measurable, the economic development of sending societies.

3. Key Issues Surrounding Integration in the Host Country as a Development Vector

Unlike the topic of immigrant integration and its effects on the host society, the links between integration in the host country and development in the sending country are a less-researched topic in the scholarly literature.

We focus on the four main debates around socioeconomic integration and its contribution to development: migrants' human and social capital and transnational engagement, the role of immigrant associations, the role of transnational knowledge networks, and political integration and engagement in the country of origin.

3.1. Acquisition of Human and Social Capital and Development

The lack of economic integration of migrants has been explained using social capital levels as well as human capital levels, education and the devaluation and nonrecognition of foreign credentials, and the lack of knowledge of official languages (Raza, Beaujot, and Woldemicael 2012).

Social and human capital seem to enjoy a mutually reinforcing relationship. Bridging social capital appears to be more useful to people with higher human capital (Li 2004). According to Li (2004) this advantage occurs because people possessing low human capital tend to rely on bonding social capital for their

2. For more information, visit <http://hdr.undp.org/en/humandev>.

economic activities rather than mainstream organizations and networks. The acquisition of bridging social capital is an important indicator of the integration of migrants because it can assist greatly in finding employment. Recent studies on the role of enclaves in Canada and Sweden challenge this view. Hiebert (2015) points to the positive economic outcomes of migrants within the enclave, given that enclaves offer their residents a chance to build bonding and bridging social capital. Bevelander and Pendakur (2012) explore the link between citizenship and employment probabilities for immigrants in Sweden, controlling for a range of demographic, human capital, and municipal characteristics such as city and co-ethnic population size. They find that the existence of co-ethnic populations within an enclave had a significant positive effect on the probability of being employed. However, a large body of literature emphasizes that the stronger the bridging social capital of migrants, the better their economic outcomes will be (Li 2004; Schellenberg and Maheux 2009; Gakunzi 2006; Pitkänen and Takala 2012).

The economic context in the destination country also plays an important role. During an economic downturn, the brain waste is not only specific to migrants given that brain waste may also exist among natives.

But the attitudes of the host society toward immigration and diversity also play an important role in integration. A solid body of literature stresses the role that discrimination plays in the lack of economic integration of migrants (for example, Marwah and Triadafilopoulos 2009; Banting 2012; Blachford and Zhang 2013). Indeed, the literature on migrant integration assumes that cohesion must address the whole of a society and not just minority communities within it. Economic integration requires a change in mainstream society. If integration is to be a two-way street, institutions need to be open to migrants, communities must welcome newcomers, and citizens must treat newcomers as equal partners (Li 2003).

As discussed below, policies and programs, such as language training and credential recognition, that promote integration of migrants, as well as antidiscrimination laws, improve newcomers' labor market opportunities, reduce unemployment and underemployment, and ultimately contribute to better economic outcomes of migrants, benefiting both the host and home societies (Schellenberg and Maheux 2009; Gakunzi 2006; Pitkänen and Takala 2012).

3.1.1. Social Capital, Economic Performance, and Development

As Hugo (2013) highlights, social capital and networks are key to the integration of migrants into the host society and to maintaining transnational linkages that can contribute to the advancement of the sending society. Social capital seems to have an effect on the economic integration of migrants, and by extension, the potential to affect development in the sending country. Two aspects need to be highlighted:

First, the economic outcomes of migrants seem to improve when they invest in building relationships and networks, not only within their own ethno-national group, but also with mainstream society. Although the empirical literature is not conclusive on the benefits of social capital for migrants' economic performance, many studies find a strong relationship between social capital and earnings (Zhou and Bankston 1994; Aguilera 2002; Tiepoh and Reimer 2004).

Raza, Beaujot, and Woldemicael (2012) study the role of human and social capital in explaining the personal earnings of foreign-born persons working full time in Canada. They find that social capital attributes such as trust were associated with higher income whereas lack of participation in community organizations was an earnings disadvantage given that community participation is a means of networking and access to resources (Adler and Kwon 2002). The development of trust, community participation, and networking enable migrants to learn the local ways of organizing and doing business, which improves their civic skills and hence contributes to their social and economic integration (Barker 2010).

Second, migrants' engagement in transnational activities increases with their social capital, which helps explain how social capital acquisition contributes to development in the sending country. Indeed, as Levitt and Jaworsky (2007) theorize, transborder activity increases with the acquisition of various socioeconomic resources by migrants. "It seems that only after migrants have acquired a certain amount of economic and social capital in the host society, they can actively engage in their home countries. Therefore, the lengths of stay in the host country, as well as higher levels of income, education and linguistic skills, often correlate with greater trans-border engagement" (Portes 2003, 886; Portes, Escobar, and Radford 2007).

Tsuda (2012) also underscores that migrants' engagement in transnational activities happens through social connections that are embedded in two societies at the same time. These connections enable them to influence the sending and receiving countries simultaneously. The implication of this finding is that integration in the host country and migrants' transborder engagement with the country of origin are not incompatible (Fitzgerald 2004; Guarnizo, Portes, and Haller 2008; Itzigsohn and Saucedo 2002; Levitt 2001; Levitt and Glick Schiller 2008; Morawska 2004; Portes, Escobar, and Radford 2007; Smith 2006). On the contrary, the available literature points out that immigrant integration in the host society can actually facilitate and increase transborder activity and vice versa: transnational activities can improve integration outcomes in the host country.

However, only a few studies have focused on how immigrant social capital affects both sending and host countries simultaneously (Baubock 2003; Fitzgerald 2004; Guarnizo 2001; Marcelli and Lowell 2005). This presents an opportunity for further research, as explained further in section 4.0.

3.1.2. Language Proficiency, Social Capital, and Development

Recent literature on integration and development mainly explores the contributions to the integration of migrants of two human capital attributes—language proficiency and educational levels.

Language proficiency is a key issue that not only affects migrants' social integration but also their economic and political integration. Cuban (2008) studies the role that education, literacy, and language proficiency had in the social networks and career mobility of caregiver women migrants in Cumbria, England. She finds that the main barrier to advancing in their careers and increasing their income was their lower English language skills, even when they had college-level educations.

Doerschler and Jackson (2010) use data from the German Socio-Economic Panel study and the German Institute for Economic Research to analyze the role of language ability in the economic integration of migrants in Germany. They find that better language skills lead to better jobs (that is, full time and better

paid) but not to a reduction in unemployment rates among migrants. Many countries, including Canada and Germany, have considered unemployment to be a sign of failed integration policies and programs. The underemployment of migrants is reasoned to be a brain waste and to lead to a loss of competitiveness.

For that reason, recent government integration policy in many countries has emphasized the need for language training. For instance, the German government currently provides a range of programs that promote German language acquisition and offer support to migrants learning the language. To this end, the government offers “900 hours of German language and 45 hours of civics instruction to become familiar with basic values such as tolerance, equal rights and freedom of speech or worship” (Haverig 2012, 10).

However, language is not enough. As Boos-Nunning and Karakasoglu (2004, 271) explain, “Knowledge of German alone does not necessarily imply a successful integration.... In addition, integration is tied to many other components such as family conditions, the integration of parents in the labor structure of the host country, financial situation, living situation, legal residency status, and not least of all the majority’s acceptance of immigrants.”

Low language proficiency hinders economic performance of migrants in yet another way, that is, it limits the participation of migrants in organizations and groups other than their own ethnic or religious organizations (Boyd 2012) negatively affecting the bridging social capital levels of migrants, although not necessarily affecting their bonding social capital. Doerschler and Jackson (2010) find that some level of language competency is necessary for establishing closer social relations, which, in turn, are needed to foster the development and maintenance of interpersonal trust. In their research, they use the European Commission’s integration indicators, controlling for language proficiency, ethnicity, and other foreigner characteristics, and find that “integration varies significantly across low, medium, and high levels of German competency” (Doerschler and Jackson 2010, 159).

As indicated in section 3.1.1., bridging social capital improves migrants’ transnational activities and as a consequence, can have a positive effect on development in the sending country. In contrast, low language proficiency limits the acquisition of bridging social capital, and therefore can have a negative effect on development. This hypothesis, however, requires further research.

3.1.3. Education, Credential Recognition, and Development

Foreign education and nonrecognition of foreign credentials often act as barriers to the economic integration of migrants (Raza, Beaujot, and Woldemicael 2012). “In spite of the international agreements and conventions, it is apparent that many overseas trained people are not productively employed in the receiving societies” (Pitkänen and Takala 2012, 238). If the professional skills of migrants are not used, they may ultimately be lost, which makes the migrants unable to contribute to either the host country or the sending country.

One of the main reasons for the nonrecognition of foreign credentials by governments is that the content of foreign education is deemed less relevant to the needs of the host country’s labor market. Another

reason is the limited knowledge of specific terms in the host society language, and the entry procedures for some trades and professions. Finally, some scholars have identified bias and unfamiliarity with foreign degrees among employers as a contributor to the issue (Mata 1999).

Recognition of credentials has proven particularly challenging for work in regulated occupations, including engineering, medicine, trades, and many others. In Canada, for instance, migrants must obtain a license to practice certain regulated occupations. Furthermore, to understand what credentials they need, immigrants must navigate a challenging net of occupational standards, policies, and by-laws that vary in different provinces and territories. For nonregulated occupations, assessment and recognition of qualifications is at the discretion of employers (CIC 2015). To address this issue, the standard approach has been to assess how well foreign credentials compare with national standards and then offer remedial education and training to bring the credentials up to that national standard.

Bridging programs, although costly for governments, employers, and migrants, have proved to be successful in helping qualified migrants move more quickly into their professions. Such programs can include workplace experience, skills training, academic upgrading, examination preparation, language training, and other individual support.

Pitkänen and Takala (2012) suggest that the solution may be found at origin, that is, that both primary and professional education should be understood in the context of the global integration of economies, politics, and social relations instead of narrow nation-bound approaches. The development of educational programs that meet the needs of transnational companies together with policies that encourage the mutual recognition of credentials will lead to improved integration outcomes of migrants in the receiving country and stronger linkages between sending and receiving countries, thereby improving development outcomes in the sending country.

These transnational educational spaces would contribute to development by linking migrants abroad to those who do not migrate. To improve these spaces, Pitkänen and Takala (2012) argue that vocational training urgently needs to be transformed. However, the most effective ways for transnational migrants to acquire broadly recognized professional competencies are still unclear. This is an important issue for further research.

3.2. Immigrant Associations and Development

The literature stresses the positive contribution of immigrant associations to the host country and to the integration of newcomers. These associations connect migrants to employment opportunities and help them meet various settlement demands that go beyond their economic needs, including language acquisition and familiarization with laws and customs. In this sense, immigrant associations improve the human capital of migrants by providing a space where the civic skills of migrants can be improved and where they can learn the local ways of organizing. As stated in section 3.1., this can make an important contribution to development.

The literature available on the role of immigrant organizations in development is limited. The available literature, however, is quite conclusive on the linkages these associations have with their homeland and their contributions to development.

Akcapar (2009) explores the role of Turkish organizations in the United States in identity formation and integration in the host society as well as in creating transnational links between countries of origin and destination. Using available secondary data, on-site observation, and primary data from semi-structured and in-depth interviews with representatives and members of Turkish-American associations, he concludes that these organizations act as catalysts for economic, cultural, and political connections between the expatriate community and the home country. The main benefits to the sending society include collaboration with nongovernmental organizations in Turkey; the financing of community projects such as hospitals and schools; transfer of ideas, know-how, and the exchange of information; and the establishment of transnational business and scientific networks such as the Turkish American Scientists and Scholars Association.

Similarly, Zhou and Lee (2013) explore the ways in which Chinese immigrant organizations in the United States engage with their homeland. They conclude that transnationalism had an impact on the level of incorporation of migrants into the host society, mainly on their economic integration. Furthermore, they find that more integration contributes to more intense transnational engagement with the homeland and transnational engagement leads to integration into the host country. They identify five main types of transnational activities in which Chinese immigrant organizations engaged with their homeland and that contribute to development: hometown development projects, philanthropic work, conventions and conferences, community events and holiday celebrations, and business partnerships (Zhou and Lee 2013, 41).

Vezzoli and Lacroix (2010) explore how the governments of Ghana, India, and Serbia have attempted to engage migrants and their organizations in national development. The Serbian diaspora requested the government's direct involvement in directing their resources to areas of need, such as improving the financial system, promoting entrepreneurship through events like the Annual Diaspora Congress of Belgrade, promoting Serbian exports, and initiatives such as the Brain Drain Reversal project carried out by the Serbian City Club in London. An institution recently created in India is providing such guidance. In Ghana, however, government involvement is limited to showcasing the achievements of migrant organizations' projects rather than intervening. The authors conclude that collective development projects are often "designed and implemented by migrants and their associations without the intervention of international development agencies or governmental bodies" (Vezzoli and Lacroix 2010, 3).

Other examples include the UN's Transfer of Knowledge Through Expatriate Nationals (TOKTEN)³ program and policies that favor investment by foreigners in their home countries.

3. For more information, see <http://www.unv.org/en/what-we-do/countries/viet-nam/doc/tokten-channels-global-expertise.html>.

Finally, multiple scholars have stressed the role of Mexican Hometown Associations (HTAs) in development. Mexican migrants in the United States organize themselves around these HTAs, which support “philanthropic projects such as the construction of schools, clinics, roads and agricultural infrastructure” (de Haas and Vezzoli 2013, 1058). For instance, Orozco and Lapointe’s (2004) study of 62 communities in Mexico where HTAs are working on a variety of projects finds that the contributions of HTAs averaged US\$23,000 and represented more than 20 percent of the municipal budget allocated for public works.

3.3. Transnational Knowledge Networks and Development

Transnational knowledge networks, often initiated by well-integrated, highly skilled migrants, have also been identified as making an important contribution to development.

Blachford and Zhang (2014) examine the contributions to development in China of Chinese-Canadian professors. In contrast to the brain drain defenders, they argue that many migrants chose to return to their homeland because of their unpromising career prospects abroad. But the top researchers and scholars remain abroad (Zweig 2006).⁴ This loss of talent, however, is not a hindrance to development.

Canadian-Chinese scholars helped to build human capital and capacity for Chinese society, even though they are not living in China. “They have given lectures, seminars, and conferences to bring the values that they believe will aid in the development of Chinese society” (Blachford and Zhang 2014, 212). Other activities conducted through these transnational networks include organization of study tours to China, exchange programs between China and Canada, publication of scholarly papers, and radio talks and public lectures. These contributions are considered “soft areas” that are often hard to measure. Blachford and Zhang (2014, 212), however, consider these domains much needed because they are key to fostering people’s cosmopolitan sensibilities (Rizvi 2009) in both societies... “and promot(ing) mutual cultural understanding between China and Canada.”

However, these transnational networks increase their impact on development only under certain conditions:

- When they enable personal experiences and not just online knowledge transfer
- When members are exposed to both realities, developing a cosmopolitan consciousness
- When national policies that encourage migration as a service to the home country are in place
- When there are positive relations between sending and host countries
- When home-country cultural centers and other academic institutions have a presence in the host country.

Hugo (2011) studies integration of the contemporary Malaysian diaspora in Australia and its impacts on Malaysian economic development, mainly through the transfer of knowledge. He concludes that sending-countries’ development can benefit by engaging the diaspora in several ways. Among other things, the

4. See Zhongguo yi chengwei xiyin quanqiu rencai de cishi? [Has China become a global talent magnet?] (http://chinese.wsj.com/gb/20060808/opn180653.asp?source_NewSearch)

diaspora can be an important source of expertise for assisting in the country's developmental efforts; the diaspora can help in the development of "knowledge networks" with Malaysians in business and research positions to encourage knowledge transfer; and diaspora scholars can hold joint positions in Malaysia that involve visits and working with counterparts in Malaysia.

Hugo (2013) concludes by stressing the need for the research community to further study the issue of transnational knowledge networks. What is the role of diaspora in knowledge transfer and the spread of ideas? How do transnational networks of academics, researchers, scientists, and technologists spread knowledge in both the sending and host societies (Hugo 2013)?

3.4. Political Integration and Engagement in the Country of Origin

The literature demonstrates a correlation between migrants' higher levels of economic and social integration and political engagement in the host country and vice versa. Allowing migrants to engage politically has been seen as promoting socioeconomic integration. Indeed, speedier naturalization laws have been found to encourage migrants to become politically active more rapidly (Marwah and Triadafilopoulos 2009). In return, migrants who become more invested in their host societies are more willing to invest in education, training, and family formation; to get a mortgage; and to affect the social norms through political participation. The OECD and the ILO in a 2011 report find that naturalized immigrants also tend to have better labor market outcomes than those who do not naturalize.

The effects of dual (or multiple) citizenship on migrant's political integration has also been a focus of the scholarly literature. Some studies highlight how dual citizenship and modest residency requirements play a role in "encouraging immigrants' decision to naturalize quickly and thus become politically active more rapidly than might otherwise be the case"(Marwah and Triadafilopoulos 2009, 2). Banulescu-Bogdan (2012)⁵ stresses the risks of banning dual citizenship because doing so may lead to a more salient ethno-cultural identity. "The principle of single citizenship may no longer make sense in a world in which mobility — rather than permanent migration — is becoming the norm. Increasing numbers of immigrants have overlapping ties to two (or more) countries, and about two-thirds of all states now recognize some form of dual citizenship" (Banulescu-Bogdan 2012).

The integration literature has long argued that the deeper the political engagement of migrants in sending-country politics, the less able they are to get involved in host-country politics (Glick Schiller and Fouron 1999; Østergaard-Nielsen 2003, 778).

However, with the emergence of the transnationalism paradigm, scholars have begun to suggest that participation in homeland politics does not have to be to the exclusion of host-society political participation. For instance, Portes, Guarnizo, and Landolt (1999) argue that transnational participation in the sending country contributes to the integration of newcomers in the host society. In the same way, Fitzgerald (2000), Guarnizo, Portes, and Haller (2008), and Tsuda (2012) argue that migrants in more socioeconomically secure positions who are politically engaged in the host society tend to become more involved in transborder homeland politics as well. This participation can result in a transfer of liberal-

5. See <http://www.migrationpolicy.org/article/shaping-citizenship-policies-strengthen-immigrant-integration>

democratic value orientations from the host to the home country (Marwah and Triadafilopoulos 2009). The transfer of values such as tolerance, equal rights, accountability, and freedom of speech is seen by multiple scholars as contributing to the development of more democratic and transparent institutions in the sending country.

Tsuda (2012, 640) identifies several types of transborder political activities that contribute positively to development in the sending country, including “voting, running for office and supporting political candidates back home, as well as trans-border political lobbying and activism. Migrants may also participate in home-country political organizations and parties or exert political influence through hometown associations that invest in development projects in sending communities.” These transnational activities challenge the traditional concept of citizenship as membership. Immigrant political participation in the host country, the home country, or in both transcends traditional sociopolitical communities (Bloemraad 2000).

Another way in which political integration can contribute to development in the sending country was long ago identified by Basch, Glick Schiller, and Szanton-Blanc (1994), who stress how migrants strengthen their political involvement in the host country to better advocate and lobby for the interests of their homeland.

The literature stresses that the better socioeconomically integrated diasporas are in the host society, the stronger their engagement in their homeland politics. The question is whether this engagement contributes to development. This constitutes an unexplored area for future research (Tsuda 2012).

4. Case Studies on Integration of Migrants as a Contribution to Development

This selection of case studies illustrates different initiatives from policy makers and civil society that promote the economic integration of migrants, potentially making a contribution to development in the sending country.

4.1. Germany: Business Network Aachen

In 2010, the city of Aachen in North Rhine-Westphalia, Germany, established a network of immigrant-owned and -operated companies in knowledge-intensive sectors. These entrepreneurs not only contribute to the city’s economy and to immigrant integration by creating direct jobs, but also serve the city’s broader interests by promoting it to networks in their executives’ countries of origin. In return, the network provides economic opportunities in those developing countries.

The city targets innovative, growth-oriented “ethnic” companies. “Its aim (is) to combine regional economic expansion with the integration of migrants in the city. By developing a member-driven network of entrepreneurs, executives and leaders from trade associations, public institutions and industry-related organizations, the network would stimulate the growth of business opportunities while changing public

perceptions about migrants and their contribution to the city.”⁶ The organization now has members representing 37 countries and 35 different industries and is seen as a community of “internationally-active/interested” companies.

4.2. Europe: Support for Immigrant Entrepreneurs

High levels of immigrant self-employment in countries such as the United States have been reported since the 19th century. However, the 20th century has witnessed an increase in the number of these entrepreneurs worldwide as well as the emergence of a new class of highly skilled immigrant entrepreneurs. Immigrant entrepreneurs are increasingly creating small businesses, particularly in the information technology and other knowledge-intensive sectors, making a substantial contribution to structural changes in advanced urban economies (Marchand and Siegel 2014). Kloosterman and Rath (2014) state that immigrant entrepreneurs foster import and export trade between host countries and sending countries, promoting economic development as well as increasing the competitive advantage of the host countries.

Several programs have successfully assisted immigrant entrepreneurs, including Enterprise Helsinki, which provides free business counseling services to entrepreneurs with 35 percent of their clients being migrants; Barcelona Activa, a city government organization that provides support to entrepreneurs, innovation, and professional improvement; and One-Stop-Shop, a Lisbon-based hub providing a composite range of services and community needs.⁷

4.3. Canada: Microloans for Immigrant Professionals

Alberta’s Immigrant Access Fund (IAF) provides internationally trained migrants with loans of up to Can\$10,000 to help cover training, professional fees, exam expenses, assessments, and books that are required to help them find work in their field of expertise and training.

IAF also provides newcomers with valuable connections that enhance their social capital and their ability to find suitable jobs. “IAF partners with community agencies that have either experience with micro loan programs, or strong ties to the immigrant population in their community. Community volunteers work closely with IAF staff to make loan decisions and build relationships with the people they loan to. These local connections have helped IAF establish a trusted network of advisors that reduces risk and ensures low write-off rates.”⁸

6. See “Relying on Immigrant Networks: Business Network Aachen” (http://citiesofmigration.ca/good_idea/business-network-aachen/#sthash.EfN7oYua.dpuf) www.citiesofmigration.ca.

7. More information on Enterprise Helsinki can be found at <http://www.yrityshelsinki.fi/en>. For information on Barcelona Activa, see http://citiesofmigration.ca/good_idea/barcelonaactiva/. For more details on One-Stop-Shop, see http://www.oss.inti.acidi.gov.pt/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=140&Itemid=78&lang=en.

8. See “Investing in Character” (http://citiesofmigration.ca/good_idea/investing-in-character-calgary-immigrant-access-fund/#sthash.U0Kmbjib.dpuf).

By promoting the socioeconomic integration of migrants and enhancing their bridging social capital, IAF grants arguably make a contribution to development in the sending country.

4.4. Israel: Military Service for Ethiopian Migrants

Flum and Cinamon (2011) study how career development and military enrollment have been used to promote a sense of belonging and integration into mainstream society of young Ethiopian migrants to Israel.

Young Ethiopian migrants were introduced into the military as a way to make them part of the Israeli collective. The policy, devised by the military authorities, created opportunities for mobility within the military as well as a basis for career advancement after military service. The training prevented marginalization because it enabled the migrants' economic integration following their military service. Given the particular political context in that region of the Middle East, the military plays an important role in the process of national identity formation. "This institutionalized effort meant to promote their sense of belongingness as an anchor of identity formation, and indeed the military service is reputed to be relatively successful in its contribution to the integration of young Ethiopian migrants into Israeli society" (Flum and Cinamon 2011, 378). This case study illustrates the importance of active antidiscrimination policies in promoting economic integration, despite societal rejection of Jewish migrants of African descent.

5. Gaps in the Research Literature

The literature exhibits a number of gaps that could be further researched. A first important question that requires further research, as suggested by Pitkänen and Takala (2012), is the role of transnational migration in the promotion of investment in education in sending societies, both by those who have migrated and by those who see education as a way to enhance the opportunity to migrate. The possible links between education in the sending country and transnational migration, and between integration of those foreign-educated professionals into the host society and their influence (through investment, knowledge transfer, and other avenues) in the sending-country education system, is still a largely unexplored field.

Another underresearched area is the contribution to development of the diaspora's political engagement in the host country. It has been argued that engagement in homeland politics seems to become stronger as migrants become more socioeconomically integrated into the host society. However, the implications for development in the sending country remain unclear.

A third issue refers to sending-country policies that more efficiently favor migrants' contributions to development of the sending country. Some of these policies are mentioned in section 3.2.

A fourth gap in the literature that requires further exploration by the academic community is identified by Hugo (2013). As discussed, transnational knowledge networks contribute greatly to knowledge transfer and the spread of ideas from host to home country and vice versa. These networks are often made

possible in part by return migrants. But in a quickly changing, knowledge-intensive world, with improved information and communication technologies, understanding how those transnational networks of academics, researchers, scientists, and technologists spread knowledge in both the sending and host societies is key for countries to maintain a competitive edge. Further research should explore how return migration and reintegration is being managed and how it affects the existence and efficiency of these transnational knowledge networks.

Another issue that requires further analysis is the link between language proficiency, social capital, and transnational activities of migrants.

Finally, another recommendation is to further explore the simultaneity of migrants' engagement in social networks in both sending and host countries. Recent literature stresses that integration in the host country and migrants' transborder engagement with the country of origin are not incompatible. In fact, the acquisition of social capital in the host country is seen as a catalyst for encouraging transnational engagement. However, how to maintain those networks simultaneously, particularly professional networks in today's information and communication technology societies, remains an understudied topic.

6. Conclusions

The links between integration in the host country and development in the sending country are an underresearched topic in the scholarly literature. Unlike the role of remittances and return migration in development, the integration of migrants in the host country has long been considered a hindrance to, rather than a potential contributor to, development. However, motivated by the emergence of migration patterns characterized by circularity, multiple stages, and increased transnational activities, and drawing from early research on social remittances, the research community has begun to study the new paradigms of integration into the host society and its links to development.

Four main conclusions can be drawn:

First, the existing literature emphasizes that migration, especially when well managed, can benefit both the host and the sending countries as well as the migrants themselves. This triple win is enabled by two main drivers. On the one hand, the host society can promote integration by fostering institutions that are open to immigrants, communities that welcome newcomers, and citizens that treat newcomers as equal partners. Policies and programs that promote migrants' economic integration, such as language training, credential recognition, progressive access to citizenship rights, and antidiscrimination laws, appear to be instrumental. Policies that include nonmigrants and nonminorities as target groups are also crucial to promoting cultural, behavioral, or attitudinal changes. On the other hand, migrants themselves can contribute to the triple win by engaging in social networks, both within their community and within mainstream society and engaging politically.

Second, integration is increasingly being characterized as participation in the social, economic, and political life of the host country, rather than as incorporation into the society. Furthermore, that participation has a transnational dimension. As it turns out, the research presented in this review shows

that participation in the host country does not necessarily reduce participation in the sending country. On the contrary, many scholars believe that transnational engagement mutually reinforces the links of migrants with the host and home countries.

Third, social capital appears to be a key component in the contribution of migration to development. The impact of individual migrants' integration into the host country does not appear to be considered by the literature. However, networks and associations that share norms, values, beliefs, or understandings can facilitate cooperation between those who emigrate and those who stay in the home country, increasing their potential positive effects on development. These effects include the development of infrastructure such as schools and hospitals, job creation through the establishment of business partnerships, the transfer of knowledge through the organization of conventions and conferences, and the transfer of liberal democratic values through the organization of community and political events.

Finally, however, researchers are confronted by important challenges in studying these new trends. Standard migration data collection does not consider migration to be part of a complex interacting system. Instead, migration is still seen as unidirectional and permanent, and integration is seen as the process of eventual absorption of migrants in the destination society and culture. To develop new theoretical migration research and policy, new data sets (for example, on migrants' multiple migration, rates of return, and double return migrants; the depth of diasporas' translational linkages beyond remittances; and the length of migrants' stay in a given country) need to be made available to researchers. This new information would allow the academic community to explore new concepts of integration, and their contribution to development, in a transnational setting.

7. Annotated Bibliography

7.1 Introduction

This section is a bibliography of the literature referred to in the report with the necessary annotations to expand on points not made in the report. The annotated bibliography is divided into three main sections.

The first section includes literature on the role of remittances and return migration on development. As indicated, migration scholars have identified three agents of development: remittances, the diaspora, and return migration. Although the literature review focuses on the second agent, oftentimes there are strong links between the three of them that need to be further explored.

The second section of this bibliography contains literature about the socioeconomic integration of migrants. Further exploration of the scholarly literature's definition of successful integration, as well as the mechanisms behind it, appears to be relevant to the purposes of KNOMAD Thematic Working Group 4.

Finally, the last section of this bibliography includes the existing literature linking migrants' integration in the host society to development in the sending country. This literature includes papers, reports, and analyses of case studies in the areas of transnational engagement of migrants (including political

engagement, transnational knowledge networks, and transnational activities of immigrant associations) and the acquisition of human and social capital and their contribution to development.

7.2 Migration and Development (Return Migration and Remittances)

Adams, W. ed. 1968. *The Brain Drain*. New York: Macmillan.

In this compilation of conference papers, brain drain is for the first time recognized as an important net loss of skilled persons from less developed countries and a net gain in the more developed ones.

Barker, F. 2010. "Maximizing the Migration Policy Buck: Uniting Temporary Labor, Development and Foreign Policy Goals in New Zealand." *Policy and Society* 29 (4): 321–31.

This article discusses state motivations, policy design, and goals across three temporary worker programs in New Zealand. It stresses the importance of such programs for development, particularly through remittances, but warns about the risk of using temporary migration programs to meet development goals, because doing so may place these goals at the mercy of fluctuations in the labor market. Permanent migration programs may be better suited to meet development goals in the long term.

Becker, S. G. 1975. *Human Capital: A Theoretical and Empirical Analysis, with Special Reference to Education*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Based on the findings that stress the importance of education in promoting economic development, Becker's study sheds light on the issue by bringing together readily available information from census reports on the incomes of persons with different amounts of education and from the Office of Education on the costs of education.

Carrington, W., and E. Detragiache. 1998. "How Big Is the Brain Drain?" IMF Working Paper 98/102, International Monetary Fund, Washington, DC.

The study covers migration from 61 developing countries to OECD countries, accounting for about 70 percent of the total population of developing countries. Using data from the 1990 U.S. census and Barro and Lee's (1993) data set on educational attainment and OECD migration data, the study concludes that a substantial brain drain was taking place in the Caribbean, Central America, and some African and Asian countries.

Davies, A., and G. Quinlivan. 2006. "A Panel Data Analysis of the Impact of Trade on Human Development." *Journal of Socio-Economics* 35: 868–76.

This paper studies the impact of international trade and migration on countries' social development as measured by the Human Development Index. The paper exemplifies how the economic sector is moving away from considerations of development only in economic terms and presents it as a composite measure of education, literacy, and income.

de Haas, H. 2005. "International Migration, Remittances and Development: Myths and Facts." *Third World Quarterly* 26 (8): 1269–84.

This paper examines the migration-development relationship through the discussion of what the author calls “seven migration myths” that are prevalent in public discourses. These myths include the following: that this is an age of unprecedented migration; that poverty and misery are the root causes of labor migration; that development policies and assistance are an effective “remedy” against migration; that migration obstructs development because of the brain drain; that the money migrants remit to sending countries is mainly spent on consumption and nonproductive investments; that remittances are a sign of lack of integration in the host country; and that migration and remittances automatically generate development and economic growth in migrant-sending areas.

Faist, T. 2007. *Transstate Social Spaces and Development: Exploring the Changing Balance between Communities, States and Markets*. Geneva: International Institute for Labour Studies.

The paper explores how transnational groups and associations interact with states and markets in migrant-induced flows of financial remittances, knowledge, and political ideas and interests across state borders. The paper argues that integration leads to a reduction in remittances, thereby affecting development.

Fletcher, M. 1999. “Migrant Settlement: A Review of the Literature and its Relevance to New Zealand.” New Zealand Immigration Service: Wellington.

In this literature review commissioned by the New Zealand Immigration Service (NZIS), Fletcher assists in operationalizing policy concepts, developing settlement indicators in New Zealand, and describing the factors affecting migrant settlement.

Global Commission on International Migration. 2005. *Migration in an Interconnected World: New Directions for Action*. Switzerland: Global Commission on International Migration.

The report addresses various issues of relevance to the literature review including the effect of labor market liberalization on migration flows, types of policies to maximize the impact of remittances in countries of origin, and the positive role of diasporas in development through investing in their countries of origin and participating in transnational knowledge networks.

Kapur, D. 2005. “Remittances: The New Development Mantra?” In *Remittances: Development Impact and Future Prospects*, edited by S. M. Maimbo and D. Ratha, 331–60. Washington, DC: World Bank.

This chapter subjects the optimism around remittances to critical scrutiny. It points to some conclusions that may prove simplistic or overoptimistic, particularly in view of the poor quality of available data on remittances.

King, R. 2000. “Generalizations from the History of Return Migration.” In *Return Migration: Journey of Hope or Despair?* edited by B. Ghosh. Geneva: IOM and UN.

This chapter presents a set of policies conducive to the successful return and reintegration of migrants to their home country.

Marcelli, E. A., and B. L. Lowell. 2005. "Transnational Twist: Pecuniary Remittances and the Socio-Economic Integration of Authorized and Unauthorized Mexican Immigrants in Los Angeles County." *International Migration Review* 39 (1): 69–102.

The authors use the 2001 Los Angeles County Mexican Immigrant Residency Status Survey to investigate how individual characteristics and social capital traditionally associated with integration, neighborhood context, and various investments in the United States influenced remittances in 2000. They conclude that remittances have been positively related to migrants' integration level.

Massey, D. S., J. Durand, and N. Malone. 2002. *Beyond Smoke and Mirrors: Mexican Immigration in an Era of Economic Integration*. New York, NY: Russell Sage Foundation.

The book explores migration trends between Mexico and the United States. It shows how the United States' migration policies in the early 2000s caused many unintended consequences: a shift away from seasonal, circular migration toward permanent settlement; the creation of a black market for Mexican labor; the transformation of Mexican immigration from a regional phenomenon into a broad social movement touching every region of the country; and even the lowering of wages for legal residents in the United States. Crucial to this literature review, it explores the effects of the economic linkages between the two countries under the migration policies and the effects of the migration policies on the economies of both countries.

Nyberg-Sørensen, N., N. Van Hear, and P. Engberg-Pedersen. 2002. "The Migration-Development Nexus: Evidence and Policy Options. State-of-the-Art Overview." *International Migration* 40 (5): 3–47.

This paper provides an overview of the thinking and available evidence on the migration-development nexus. It highlights some of the concerns about remittances, such as increasing real estate prices in the home country.

OECD (Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development). 2001. "The Well-Being of Nations: The Role of Human and Social Capital." Centre for Educational Research and Innovation, Paris.

This report describes evidence covering investment in human capital and its impact on growth and well-being; describes and clarifies the concept of social capital; and identifies the roles of human and social capital in realizing sustainable economic and social development.

OECD (Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development). 2006. "International Migrant Remittances and Their Role in Development." Part III in *International Migration Outlook 2006*. Paris: OECD.

This chapter of the report provides an overview of the state-of-the-art literature (as of 2006) on the relationship between remittances and development.

Qureshi, K., V. J. Varghese, and F. Osella. 2013. "Indian Punjabi Skilled Migrants in Britain: Of Brain Drain and Under-Employment." *Journal of Management Development* 32 (2): 182–92.

This paper examines the careers of skilled migrants from Indian Punjab. This study complicates the normalization of skilled migration as a "win-win" situation by examining the career trajectories of skilled migrants from the Indian Punjab who are trying to establish themselves in Britain.

Ratha, D. 2013. "The Impact of Remittances on Economic Growth and Poverty Reduction." Migration Policy Institute, Washington, DC.

The paper explores the impact of remittances beyond purely economic gains. It argues that remittances also contribute to human development in areas such as health, education, and gender equality.

Sanderson, M. 2009. "International Migration and Human Development in Destination Countries: A Cross-National Analysis of Less-Developed Countries, 1970–2005." *Social Indicators Research Journal* 96 (1): 59–83.

The paper makes a case for expanding the definition of development beyond gross domestic product to include other human development attributes such as education and health.

Stark, O., and C. S. Fan. 2007. "The Brain Drain, 'Educated Unemployment,' Human Capital Formation, and Economic Betterment." *Economics of Transition* 15 (4): 629–60.

The paper analyzes both the negative and the positive impacts of migration by skilled individuals in a unified framework.

Tsai, M.-C. 2006. "Does Political Democracy Enhance Human Development in Developing Countries? A Cross-National Analysis." *American Journal of Economics and Sociology* 65 (2): 233–68.

This cross-national study uses a large sample of developing countries to offer necessary testing of the impact of democracy on human development. The paper considers development in a broader sense than purely economic.

Tsai, M.-C. 2007. "Does Globalization Affect Human Well-Being?" *Social Indicators Research* 81 (1): 103–26.

This paper examines the influence of political, economic, and social globalization on the Human Development Index. It concludes that globalization identified by increased migration flows and exchanges contributes to rather than hampers human development. The paper considers development in a broader sense than purely economic.

United Nations. 2006. "International Migration and Development, Report of the Secretary General. Report Presented at the Sixtieth Session of Globalization and Interdependence." United Nations, New York, May 18.

This report explains the positive contributions of remittances to development.

White, A. 2014. "Polish Migration and Double Return Migration." *Europe-Asia Studies* 66 (1): 25–49.

The article explores why many returned migrants face reintegration problems in Poland (frustration with the governance structures, difficulty in finding a job, underemployment, and so on) and decide to migrate to the United Kingdom again, this time to be more focused on integration in the host country and not on returning. This is an interesting consideration for sending countries that want to retain talent through return migration.

World Bank. 2006. *Global Economic Prospects 2006: Economic Implications of Remittances and Migration*. Washington, DC: World Bank.

This report argues that migration, particularly through remittances, can have a net positive effect in origin countries in certain contexts. It explains how policies can increase the role of remittances in reducing poverty.

7.3 Socioeconomic Integration of Migrants

Banting, K. 2014. "Transatlantic Convergence? Immigrant Integration in Canada and Europe." *International Journal* 69 (1): 66–84.

The paper argues that Canada and Europe are walking parallel paths with regard to citizenship and migrant integration. It stresses how discrimination plays an important role in the lack of economic integration of migrants.

Bevelander, P., and R. Pendakur. 2012. "Citizenship, Co-ethnic Populations, and Employment Probabilities of Immigrants in Sweden." *Journal of International Migration and Integration* 13 (2): 203–22.

This paper explores the link between citizenship and employment probabilities for immigrants in Sweden, controlling for a range of demographic, human capital, and municipal characteristics such as city and co-ethnic population size.

Bloemraad, I. 2000. "Citizenship and Immigration: A Current Review." *Journal of International Migration and Integration* 1 (1): 9–37.

The paper stresses the political nature of the integration process. The author argues that political integration leads to political engagement in the sending country and vice versa.

Boos-Nunning, U., and Y. Karakasoglu. 2004. *Viele Welten Leben: Lebenslagen von Mädchen und jungen Frauen mit griechischem, italienischem, jugoslawischem, türkischem und Aussiedlerhintergrund*. Berlin: Bundesministerium für Familie, Senioren, Frauen, und Jugend.

This highlights the elements that account for the lack of integration of migrants in Germany. Knowledge of the German language is key but so are family conditions, the integration of parents in the labor structure of the host country, financial situation, living situation, legal residency status, and not least of all, the majority's acceptance of migrants.

Flum, H., and R. G. Cinamon. 2011. "Immigration and the Interplay among Citizenship, Identity and Career: The Case of Ethiopian Immigration to Israel." *Journal of Vocational Behavior* 78 (3): 372–80.

The paper explores the links between three foundational concepts in the migration experiences of Ethiopian Jewish immigrants in Israel: citizenship, identity, and career. It presents a case study of economic and social integration through military service.

Haverig, A. 2012. "Managing Integration: German and British Policy Responses to the 'Threat from Within' Post-2001." *Journal of International Migration and Integration* 14 (2): 345–62.

The paper describes integration as a two-way process of incorporation and adherence to common values, moral principles, and codes of behavior.

Hugo, G. 2013. "Migration and Development in Asia and a Role for Australia." *Journal of Intercultural Studies* 34 (2): 141–59.

The paper explains how migration can play a facilitating role for development in the Asia and Pacific region. It argues that despite the negative effects of the brain drain, migration can have a positive impact in the sending country when the right policies are in place. The three main agents of development include remittances, the integration of the diaspora in the host country, and return migration.

Institute for Strategic Dialogue (ISD). 2012. "Integration and Cohesion in Europe: An Overview." ISD, London.

This paper sets out some of the theoretical approaches to promoting integration. It draws conclusions and uses them to assess the activities of certain national approaches. It provides a comprehensive definition of integration.

Kloosterman, R., and J. Rath. 2001. "Immigrant Entrepreneurs in Advanced Economies: Mixed Embeddedness Further Explored." *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 27 (2): 189–202.

This paper highlights some of the ways in which immigrant entrepreneurs contribute to economic development by fostering import and export trade between host countries and sending countries, which promotes economic development and increases the competitive advantage of the host countries.

Kloosterman, R., and J. Rath. 2014. "Immigrant Entrepreneurship." In *An Introduction to Immigrant Incorporation Studies. European Perspectives*, edited by M. Martiniello and J. Rath, 195–225. IMISCOE Textbook Series 3. Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press.

The chapter describes immigrant entrepreneurs' incorporation in action in different fields, policy issues, and normative dimensions.

Li, P. S. 2003. "Deconstructing Canada's Discourse of Immigrant Integration." *Journal of International Migration and Integration* 4 (3): 315–33.

The paper describes integration as a two-way process of incorporation and participation.

Marchand, K., and M. Siegel. 2014. "Immigrant Entrepreneurship in Cities." Background paper for *World Migration Report 2015*. International Organization for Migration, Geneva.

The focus of this paper is the intersection of migration and entrepreneurship, specifically looking at business activities of immigrants in cities.

Marwah, I., and T. Triadafilopoulos. 2009. "Europeanizing Canada's Citizenship Regime?" *Canada-Europe Transatlantic Dialogue*, Strategic Knowledge Cluster, Center for European Studies, Ottawa.

This article analyzes the changes to Canada's Citizenship Act. It stresses how antidiscrimination policies and laws that protect visible minorities make a greater contribution to migrants' integration than the toughening of citizenship requirements.

Morawska, E. 2004. *For Bread with Butter. The Life-Worlds of East Central Europeans in Johnstown, Pennsylvania, 1890–1940*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

The book studies the intentions and goals of policy makers in the context of the development of labor law from the late nineteenth century, in the United States. It shows how public policy has been shaped to confine labor's role in the American economy, and that many of the unions' problems stem from the laws which purport to protect them.

Ngan, L. L., and K. W. Chan. 2013. "An Outsider Is Always an Outsider: Migration, Social Policy and Social Exclusion in East Asia." *Journal of Comparative Asian Development* 12 (2): 316–50.

The article examines the migration, labor, and social security policies aimed at low-skilled migrant workers in Seoul, Korea, and Taiwan, China; low-skilled migrants in Hong Kong SAR; and rural-to-urban migrants in Beijing. It argues that the way in which readily government-enforced policies embrace migrants is crucial to the reinforcement of social stratification. It concludes that the ability to find suitable employment is strongly affected by discrimination and social stigma.

OECD (Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development). 2013. "Discrimination against Immigrants – Measurement, Incidence and Policy Instruments." In *International Migration Outlook 2013*. Paris: OECD.

This chapter argues that discrimination is a key obstacle to the full integration of migrants and their offspring into the labor market and into society as a whole. It provides an overview of discrimination against migrants and their children in OECD countries—its measurement, incidence, and policy solutions—on the basis of the empirical literature and policy practices.

Portes, A. 2003. "Conclusion: Theoretical Convergences and Empirical Evidence in the Study of Immigrant Transnationalism." *International Migration Review* 37 (3): 874–92.

This article emphasizes that migrants must acquire a certain amount of economic and social capital in the host society before they can engage in transnational and development activities in the home country.

Smith, R. C. 2006. *Mexican New York: Transnational Lives of New Immigrants*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

This book hypothesizes that integration and transnationalism are not incompatible. Studying the movement of Mexican migrants moving back and forth between New York and their home village in Puebla, the author explains how the migrants borrow from and contribute to both communities.

Tsuda, T. 2012. "Whatever Happened to Simultaneity? Transnational Migration Theory and Dual Engagement in Sending and Receiving Countries." *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* 38 (4): 631–49.

This paper argues that simultaneity is an important part of transnationalism that distinguishes it from long-distance nationalism. It describes the conditions under which migrants can engage in transnational activities, stressing that only after migrants have acquired a certain amount of economic and social capital in the host society can they actively engage in their home countries.

Yan, M. C., and S. Lauer. 2008. "Social Capital and Ethno-Cultural Diverse Immigrants: A Canadian Study on Settlement House and Social Integration." *Journal of Ethnic and Cultural Diversity in Social Work* 17 (3): 229–50.

This article studies the role of "settlement houses" in an urban center of Vancouver, Canada, as enhancers of migrants' bridging social capital. It concludes that they have helped newcomers build cross-group social ties and integrate into the community by promoting volunteering and providing holistic services to meet the needs of migrants.

7.4 Integration and Development: Transnationalism, Human and Social Capital

Adler, P. S., and S. Kwon. 2002. "Social Capital: Prospects for a New Concept." *The Academy of Management Review* 27 (1): 17–40.

This article seeks to clarify the concept of social capital and help assess its utility for organizational theory. It develops a common conceptual framework that identifies the sources, benefits, risks, and contingencies of social capital.

Aguilera, M. B. 2002. "The Impact of Social Capital on Labor Force Participation: Evidence from the 2000 Social Capital Benchmark Survey." *Social Science Quarterly* 83 (3): 853–74.

This article studies the relationship between friendship networks and labor force participation as represented by employment and hours worked. It concludes that there is a strong relationship between social capital and earnings. Programs that attempt to bring valuable labor market information to individuals and communities lacking employment-related information are likely to be effective in reducing inequality, especially if combined with programs for developing human capital.

Akcapar, S. K. 2009. "Turkish Associations in the United States: Towards Building a Transnational Identity." *Turkish Studies* 10 (2): 165–93.

This essay argues that immigrants' organizational dynamics are greatly affected by the general attitude toward migrants in the host country and homeland policies regarding emigrants. It concludes that immigrant organizations act as catalysts of the economic, cultural, and political connections between the expatriate community and the home country.

Barker, F. 2010. "Maximizing the Migration Policy Buck: Uniting Temporary Labor, Development and Foreign Policy Goals in New Zealand." *Policy and Society* 29 (4): 321–31.

The paper examines state motivations, policy design, and goals across temporary worker programs in New Zealand. It argues that the proliferation of micro guest-worker programs may risk producing conflicting policy consequences, which could in turn be damaging to the goals and success of individual temporary worker programs.

Basch, L., N. Glick Schiller, and C. Szanton-Blanc. 1994. *Nations Unbound: Transnational Projects and the Deterritorialized Nation-State*. New York: Gordon and Breach.

Through ethnographic studies of migrant populations, the authors argue that transnationalism is something other than expanded nationalism. Transnationalism challenges the concepts of citizenship and of nationhood itself.

Baubock, R. 2003. "Towards a Political Theory of Migrant Transnationalism." *International Migration Review* 37 (3): 700–72.

This paper argues that transnationalism is not only about a narrowly conceived set of activities through which migrants become involved in the domestic affairs of their home countries; it also affects collective identities and conceptions of citizenship among the native populations in both receiving and sending societies. Within this general framework the article suggests a set of hypotheses for how migrant social capital affects both sending and host countries simultaneously.

Blachford, D. R., and B. Zhang. 2014. "Rethinking International Migration of Human Capital and Brain Circulation: The Case of Chinese-Canadian Academics." *Journal of Studies in International Education* 18 (3): 202–22.

This article examines the dynamics of brain circulation through a historical review of the debates about international migration of human capital and a case study on Chinese-Canadian academics. Interviews with 22 Chinese-Canadian professors who originally came from China provide rich data regarding the possibilities and problems of contemporary global mobility.

Boyd, M. 2012. *Joining and Belonging: Language Use and the Civic Participation of Immigrants*. Toronto: University of Toronto.

This book uses the 2002 Ethnic Diversity Survey to explore indicators of civic participation of migrants in Canadian society. It concludes that low language proficiency leads to lower participation in organizations and community groups, increased participation in ethnic or religious organizations, and lower feelings of belonging.

CIC (Citizenship and Immigration Canada). 2015. *Survival to Success: Transforming Immigrant Outcomes*. Canada: CIC.

This report draws on consultations with Canadian migrant-serving organizations, regulators, employers, and other stakeholders to identify and report on successes, innovative approaches, and promising practices on the licensing, hiring, and retention of recent migrants, as well as the challenges of this process faced by employers.

Cuban, S. 2008. "Home/Work: The Roles of Education, Literacy, and Learning in the Networks and Mobility of Professional Women Migrant Carers in Cumbria." *Ethnography and Education* 3 (1): 81–96.

This article studies the barriers to caregivers' integration and advancement. Based on interviews conducted with care training specialists, caregivers, and employers across England, the author concludes that lack of language proficiency, extenuating work shifts, and bias were the main obstacles to advancement in their careers.

de Haas, H., and S. Vezzoli. 2013. "Migration and Development on the South-North Frontier: A Comparison of the Mexico-US and Morocco-EU Cases." *Journal of Migration and Ethnic Studies* 39 (7): 1041–65.

This paper aims to improve the understanding of migration-development links by comparing the Mexico-United States and Morocco–European Union cases. The paper explains certain mechanisms, such as Mexican Hometown Associations, by which migrants' integration into the host society contributes to development in the sending country.

Doerschler, P., and P. I. Jackson. 2010. "Host Nation Language Ability and Immigrant Integration in Germany: Use of GSOEP to Examine Language as an Integration Criterion." *Democracy and Security* 6: 147–82.

Using data from the German Socio-Economic Panel study and the German Institute for Economic Research, this article explores the role of language ability in the economic integration of migrants in Germany. The authors find that better language skills lead to better jobs (that is, full time and better paid) but not to a reduction in unemployment rates among migrants.

Dunn, K. M. 2005. "A Paradigm of Transnationalism for Migration Studies." *New Zealand Population Review* 31 (2): 15–31.

This paper strongly advocates for the utility of a transnationalism paradigm for population studies. It presents the different forms of transnationalism, including political, economic, and sociocultural; the drivers of transnationalism; and a critique of the transnationalism paradigm.

Fitzgerald, D. 2000. "Negotiating Extra-Territorial Citizenship: Mexican Migration and the Transnational Politics of Community." La Jolla: Center for Comparative Immigration Studies, University of California, San Diego.

This paper draws on evidence from ethnographic fieldwork in Michoacán, Mexico, and Southern California to propose a process-based model of extra-territorial citizenship in which migrants claim citizenship in their places of origin, even when they are physically absent.

Fitzgerald, D. 2004. "Beyond 'Transnationalism': Mexican Hometown Politics at an American Labour Union." *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 27 (2): 228–47.

Based on a six-month ethnographic study of an immigrant labor union in Southern California, this paper concludes that integration in the host country and the migrants' transborder engagement with the country of origin are not incompatible. On the contrary, by disaggregating the types of political borders, types of nationalism, and levels of identification that have been conflated in the framework of "transnationalism," the author finds that political and economic participation of migrants in both their communities of origin and destination are not incompatible but mutually reinforcing.

Fletcher, Peri L. 1999. *La Casa de Mis Sueños: Dreams of Home in a Transnational Migrant Community*. Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

The book examines the efforts of villagers from Napízaro, Mexico, to build their "dream houses" in Mexico through participation in transnational migration.

Frank, R. H., and B. S. Bernanke. 2007. *Principles of Microeconomics* (3rd ed.). New York: McGraw-Hill/Irwin.

This book provides a paradigmatic definition of human capital.

Gakunzi, D., ed. 2006. *Social Remittances of the African Diasporas in Europe*. Lisbon: North-South Centre of the Council of Europe.

This study aims to generate information and analysis and raise policy awareness of the largely untapped social remittances of the African diaspora.

Glick Schiller, N., L. Basch, and C. Blanc-Szanton. 1992. "Transnationalism: A New Analytic Framework for Understanding Migration." In *Towards a Transnational Perspective on Migration: Race, Class, Ethnicity, and Nationalism Reconsidered*, edited by N. Glick Schiller, L. Basch, and C. Blanc-Szanton, 1–24. New York: New York Academy of Sciences.

This work is one of the first to advocate applying the transnationalism paradigm to human migration.

Glick Schiller, N., and G. Fouron. 2003. "Killing Me Softly: Violence, Globalization, and the Apparent State." In *Globalization, the State and Violence*, edited by Jonathan Friedman. Oxford: Altamira.

In this chapter, the authors argue that the deeper the political engagement of migrants in sending-country politics, the less able they are to get involved in host-country politics.

Guarnizo, L. E. 2001. "On the Political Participation of Transnational Migrants: Old Practices and New Trends." In *E Pluribus Unum? Contemporary and Historical Perspectives on Immigrant Political Incorporation*, edited by G. Gerstle and J. Mollenkopf, 213–63. New York: Russell Sage Foundation.

This chapter explores the transnational political activities of migrants.

Guarnizo, L. E., A. Portes, and W. Haller. 2008. "Assimilation and Transnationalism: Determinants of Transnational Political Action among Contemporary Migrants." In *The Transnational Studies Reader: Intersections and Innovations*, edited by S. Khagram and P. Levitt, 118–34. New York: Routledge.

This study stresses that the integration of migrants in the host country and their transborder political engagement with the country of origin are not incompatible.

Hiebert, D. 2015. "Ethnocultural Minority Enclaves in Montreal, Toronto and Vancouver." IRPP Study 52, Institute for Research on Public Policy, Montreal.

Hiebert has conducted a statistical analysis of enclaves in three metropolitan areas of Canada. His principal findings are these: enclave landscapes are becoming prevalent in Toronto and Vancouver but less so in Montreal; certain visible minority groups are more prone to reside in enclaves than others; the socioeconomic characteristics of enclaves vary significantly; minority enclaves are places of cultural diversity rather than cultural isolation; there are *some* systematic differences between the socioeconomic profiles of visible minority residents of enclaves and those living in other residential settings, but these populations do not appear to be fundamentally different; and more members of visible minority groups experiencing poverty live outside enclaves than inside them.

Hugo, G. 2011. "Migration and Development in Malaysia: An Emigration Perspective." *Asian Population Studies* 7 (3): 219–41.

The article explores the potential role of the Malaysian diaspora in Australia in the development of the home country. Hugo concludes that members of the diaspora can be an important source of expertise for assisting in the home country's developmental efforts; they can help in the development of "knowledge networks" with Malaysians in business and research positions encouraging knowledge transfer; and diaspora scholars can hold joint positions in Malaysia that involve visits to and working with counterparts in Malaysia.

Itzigsohn, J., and S. G. Saucedo. 2002. "Immigrant Incorporation and Sociocultural Transnationalism." *International Migration Review* 36 (3): 766–98.

The paper analyzes sociocultural transnational linkages among Colombian, Dominican, and Salvadoran immigrants in the United States and concludes that migrants' integration in the United States does not weaken transnational participation.

Levitt, P. 1998. "Social Remittances: A Local-Level, Migration-Driven Form of Cultural Diffusion." *International Migration Review* 32 (124): 926–49.

In this essay, Levitt defines the concept of social remittances and identifies the ways in which these ideas, behaviors, identities, and social capital are transferred from sending to home country.

Levitt, P. 2001. *The Transnational Villagers*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

This book explores the familial, religious, and political connections that arise between Miraflores, a town in the Dominican Republic, and Jamaica Plain, a neighborhood in Boston. It explains some of the processes through which migrants maintain ties with both countries and create communities that span borders. Finally, it describes the ways in which these ties transform life in both the home and host countries.

Levitt, P., and N. Glick Schiller. 2008. "Conceptualizing Simultaneity: A Transnational Social Field Perspective on Society." In *The Transnational Studies Reader: Intersections and Innovations*, edited by S. Khagram and P. Levitt, 284–94. New York: Routledge.

This chapter explores the social theory and consequent methodology that underpins studies of transnational migration.

Levitt, P., and B. N. Jaworsky. 2007. "Transnational Migration Studies: Past Developments and Future Trends." *Annual Review of Sociology* 33 (1): 129–56.

This literature review offers a short history of theoretical developments, outlining the different ways in which scholars have defined and approached transnational migration. The authors conclude that transborder activity increases with the acquisition of various socioeconomic resources by migrants.

Li, Z. 2004. "International Transference of Human Capital and Occupational Attainment of Recent Chinese Professional Immigrants in Canada." *American Review of China Studies* 5 (1): 81–89.

This article examines the dynamics of brain circulation through a historical review of the debates about international migration of human capital and a case study on Chinese-Canadian academics.

Mata, F. 1999. *The Non-Accreditation of Immigrant Professionals in Canada: Societal Dimensions of the Problem*. Ottawa: Metropolis.

The author describes how poor information on accreditation procedures is the first major barrier to be faced in immigration settlement in Canada.

Morawska, E. 2003. "Immigrant Transnationalism and Assimilation: A Variety of Combinations and a Theoretical Model They Suggest." In *Toward Assimilation and Citizenship: Immigrants in Liberal Nation-States*, edited by C. Joppke and E. Morawska, 133–76. New York: Palgrave.

This chapter highlights what the author calls a "new trend in migration studies"—that contemporary migrants are simultaneously assimilating and transnationalizing.

OECD (Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development) and ILO (International Labour Organisation). 2011. "Giving Youth a Better Start: A Policy Note for the G20 Meeting of Labour and Employment Ministers," September. <http://www.oecd.org/g20/topics/employment-and-social-policy/48732154.pdf>.

The report provides key recommendations to improve labor market outcomes of youth including second-generation immigrants.

Orozco, M., and M. Lapointe. 2004. "Mexican Hometown Associations and Development Opportunities." *Journal of International Affairs* 57 (2): 31–51.

This policy brief synthesizes a larger report on the development roles of hometown associations and the effectiveness of the 3x1 matching-grant program. The study includes interviews with more than 100 hometown associations operating throughout the United States and working in various Mexican states.

Østergaard-Nielsen, E. 2003. "The Politics of Migrants' Transnational Political Practices." *International Migration Review* 37 (3): 760–86.

This article examines transnational engagement of migrants and refugees in political processes. Based on inductive reading of existing scholarship, in particular the author's own research on Turks and Kurds in Europe, the article discusses key concepts and trends in the understanding of why, how, and with what consequences migrants engage in transnational political practices. The results of this research contradict the main hypothesis presented in this review by stating that the more time, effort, and resources they expend engaging in sending-country politics, the less able they are to get involved in politics in the receiving country.

Pitkänen, P., and T. Takala. 2012. "Using Transnational Lenses to Analyse Interconnections between Migration, Education and Development." *Migration and Development* 1 (2): 229–43.

The article explores education and acquisition of skills in the context of transnationalism. It suggests that both basic and professional education should be understood in the context of the global integration of economies, politics, and social relations, to better equip migrants.

Portes, A. 2001. "Introduction: The Debates and Significance of Immigrant Transnationalism." *Global Networks* 1 (3): 181–94.

The article argues that migrants' transnational activities will continue to grow and have stronger impacts on both migrant adaptation in receiving countries and the development prospects of sending nations and communities. This effect is due to the simultaneity of the transnational engagement of migrants.

Portes, A., C. Escobar, and A. W. Radford. 2007. "Immigrant Transnational Organizations and Development: A Comparative Study." *International Migration Review* 41 (1): 242–81.

This article explores how 90 Colombian, Dominican, and Mexican transnational migrant organizations pursue philanthropic projects that aid in the development of their countries or communities of origin. The authors find that participation in transnational activities and assimilation are not incompatible.

Portes, A., L. E. Guarnizo, and P. Landolt. 1999. "The Study of Transnationalism: Pitfalls and Promise of an Emergent Research Field." *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 22: 217–37.

This paper explain the ways in which transnational identities challenge the traditional understanding of citizenship.

Putnam, R. D. 2000. *Bowling Alone: The Collapse and Revival of American Community*. New York: Simon and Schuster.

In this book, Putnam draws on evidence that includes nearly 500,000 interviews over the last quarter century to show how social capital has plummeted in the United States. The book provides a paradigmatic definition of social capital and its types.

Raza, M., R. Beaujot, and G. Woldemicael. 2012. "Social Capital and Economic Integration of Visible Minority Immigrants in Canada." *Journal of International Migration and Integration* 14 (2): 263–85.

This article draws from the 2002 Ethnic Diversity Survey to study the role of human and social capital in explaining the earnings of foreign-born persons working full time in Canada. It concludes that education and English language proficiency affect earnings positively, and that lack of participation in community organizations is an earnings disadvantage.

Rizvi, F. 2009. "Global Mobility and the Challenges of Educational Research and Policy." *Yearbook of the National Society for the Study of Education* 108 (2): 268–89.

The study analyzes the evolution of educational ideas in the era of globalization. It focuses on the new modes of production and dissemination of educational knowledge globally.

Schellenberg, G., and H. Maheux. 2009. *Immigrants' Perspectives on Their Four Years in Canada: Highlights from Three Waves of the Longitudinal Survey of Immigrants to Canada*. Ottawa: Statistics Canada.

This report examines the subjective assessments and perceptions of immigrants to Canada.

Tiepoh, G., and R. Reimer. 2004. "Social Capital, Information Flows, and Income Creation in Rural Canada: A Cross Community Analysis." *Journal of Socio-Economics* 33 (4): 427–48.

This article uses data on household and community social capital for rural Canada to conclude that the ability of people to organize and use their social capital does influence their income level. Social capital facilitates the flow of income-related knowledge and information between economic agents.

Vertovec, S. 2009. *Transnationalism*. London: Routledge.

Vertovec provides a definition of reference for transnationalism: "the multiple ties and interactions linking people or institutions across the borders of nation-states." He also stresses that transnationalism has its greatest utility as an umbrella concept, not necessarily as a narrow descriptor of certain activities, or even certain social fields or perspectives.

Vezzoli, S. and T. Lacroix. 2010. "Building Bonds for Migration and Development: Diaspora Engagement Policies of Ghana, India and Serbia." Eschborn: Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit.

This study examines migrant communities and organizations from three countries—Ghana, India, and Serbia—and explores how the governments of these countries have perceived "their" respective migrants and, more specifically, the way in which these governments have attempted to engage migrants and their organizations in the interest of national development.

Zhou, Y. R. 2013. "Toward Transnational Care Interdependence: Rethinking the Relationships between Care, Immigration and Social Policy." *Global Social Policy* 13 (3): 280–98.

Based on a study of Chinese grandparents' caregiving experiences in Canada, this article shows how transnational families of Chinese skilled migrants have participated in redistributing care resources, including emotion, time, and cultural knowledge, across generations and countries, arguably making a contribution to development in their home country.

Zhou, M., and C. Bankston. 1994. "Social Capital and Adaptation of the Second Generation: The Case of Vietnamese Youth in New Orleans." *International Migration Review* 28 (4): 821–45.

This article explores the ways in which social capital in migrant communities contributes to the integration of younger generations. It concludes that social capital is more important than human capital for the successful integration of younger migrants.

Zhou, M., and R. Lee. 2013. "Transnationalism and Community Building: Chinese Immigrant Organizations in the United States." *The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Sciences* 647 (1): 22–49.

This paper explores the ways in which Chinese immigrant organizations in the United States engage with their homeland. It concludes that transnationalism had an impact on the level of incorporation of migrants into the host society, mainly on their economic integration.

