

Migration: From threat of Climate Change to Adaptation Tool

RMMRU Team

Tasneem Siddiqui,
Towheedul Islam and
Rashed Alam Bhuiyan

SCMR Team

Richard Black,
Dominic Kniveton and
Maxmillan Martin

Presented at the **KNOMAD** International Conference on
Internal Migration and Urbanization
held in Dhaka on April 30-May 1, 2014



The Research

- ❑ RMMRU of the University of Dhaka and SCMR of the University of Sussex have recently completed a research on *climate change related migration in Bangladesh* supported by the CDKN.

- ❑ Research questions:
 - I. How does climate change induce migration in Bangladesh? What would be its extent by 2050?
 - II. What types of migration are more sensitive to climate change?
 - III. Are the policies and interventions currently in operation equipped enough to deal with CC migration?
 - IV. Can migration be used as one of the adaptation tools?

Methodology

- ❑ Village level community surveys and in-depth interviews
- ❑ Spatial exploration of 2001 and 2011 census data
- ❑ Analysis of development and climate change related policies
- ❑ Longitudinal survey of **1500 migrant and non-migrant** households in climatic stressed areas of Bangladesh;
- ❑ Study sites:
 - i. Origin Areas: Chapai Nawabganj, Satkhira and Munshiganj representing droughts, cyclones, saline intrusion, riverbank erosion and floods.
 - ii. Destination areas: Khulna, Metropolitan Dhaka and Keraniganj

Number of Respondents

Area	Migrant	Non-migrant	Total
Satkhira	129	172	301
Khulna	200	00	200
Chapai Nawabganj	118	182	300
Metro Dhaka	201	00	201
Munshiganj	52	256	308
Keraniganj	192	00	192
Total	892	610	1502

Does Climate Stress Induce Migration?

- ❑ Important links between migration and climatic stresses.
- ❑ Difficult to distinguish the role of climate change viz a viz other social, economic and political factors in driving migration.
- ❑ Facing similar climatic hazards a section of affected people migrated while the other did not.

Does Climate Stress Induce Migration? *Cont.*

- ❑ On an average migrant and non-migrant households relocated their residence **2.61 times**
- ❑ **75%** of all households both migrant and non-migrant experienced different types of climatic stresses in their dwellings in different periods of their lives
- ❑ **50%** of them experienced multiple stresses.
- ❑ Yet the respondents did not think they have moved primarily due to climatic stresses.

Does Climate Stress Induce Migration? *Cont.*

- ❑ **Only 10%** of the respondents attributed primary reason of their migration to climatic stresses.
- ❑ **27%** thought, they moved for lack of work in the origin areas, and availability of work in destination areas.
- ❑ **34.5%** moved to earn an income and live a better life and **9.1%** attributed to poverty as their reason for migration. others identified marriage, study and accompanying families as their major reasons.
- ❑ People experiencing **sudden onset events** linked their migration to climatic stresses more readily compared to those facing **slow onset process**.
- ❑ People in destination areas linked climatic stresses to migration more compared to people in origin area

Who Migrates?

- ❑ In case of displacement, all the members of the family migrated.
- ❑ In case of livelihood migration from Chapai Nababganj and Satkhira **mostly adult men migrated.**
- ❑ From Munshiganj, both **adult men and women migrated.**

How many people may migrate due to climate change by 2050?

- ❑ Based on historical analysis of **upazila level census data of 2001 and 2011** and predictions of global climate models and the World Bank Studies of 2010 and 2011,
- ❑ From 2011 to 2050, as many as **16 to 26 million** people would migrate from those upazilas affected by floods, storm surges, riverbank erosion and sea-level rise.
- ❑ **2-5 million** people will migrate from those upazilas affected by riverbank erosion
- ❑ **3-6 million** will migrate from those upazilas affected by inland flooding and
- ❑ **5-7 million** will migrate from those upazilas affected by coastal storm surges.
- ❑ **6- 8 million** will migrate from those upazilas affected by sea level rise.
- ❑ Influence of climate change alone will cause at least **half to 1 million extra** migrants at this time scale.

Are All Types of Migratory Flows Equally Sensitive to Climate Change?

<i>Dominant types of migratory flows in Bangladesh</i>	<i>Sensitivity to Climate Change</i>
<i>Internal migration</i>	<i>High sensitivity</i>
<i>Internal displacement</i>	<i>High sensitivity</i>
<i>Cross border mobility</i>	<i>Mixed sensitivity</i>
<i>Short term int'l contract migration</i>	<i>Mixed sensitivity</i>
<i>Long-term permanent migration to the West</i>	<i>Extremely Low sensitivity</i>

Are development and climate change policies well equipped to deal with migration?

- ❑ Four sets of policies have been reviewed- a) CC and adaptation policies, b) development and poverty reduction policies, c) disaster-management policies, and d) migration policies.

CC and adaptation policies

- ❑ **NAPA, 2005** presents migration as a threat of climate change and different projects developed under NAPA targeted to reduce the scope of migration and thus halt undesired “social consequences” of migration to cities. The updated NAPA document of 2009, however, has omitted the negative references of migration.
- ❑ **BCCSAP** of 2008 saw migration of climate change affected people as problem of unplanned urbanisation. The revised **BCCSAP of 2009** highlights the need to understand the dynamics of climate change induced migration. It suggested for resettlement of “environmental refugees” in the developed countries.

Are development and climate change policies well equipped to deal with migration? *Cont.*

Development and poverty reduction policies

- ❑ The review includes the Sixth Five Year Plan, Ten Year Perspective Plan, PRSP, MDGs and Coastal Zone Management Plan.
- ❑ All these documents highlight the importance of short-term labour migration in the economic development of Bangladesh and a few of them stressed on increasing the potential of this strand of migration.
- ❑ Most of these documents except MDG highlight the problems of internal migration and did not appreciate the contribution of internal migrants unlike what they did for international migrants.
- ❑ MDG showed empathy to internal migrations and suggested some welfare measures for slum dwellers.
- ❑ There is hardly any right-based approach in these policies for the protection of the rights of internal migrants.
- ❑ The Coastal Zone Development policy did not even mention migration.

Are development and climate change policies well equipped to deal with migration? *Cont.*

Disaster management policies

- ❑ The disaster management policies and act presents migration as a vulnerability of the poor.

Migration policies

- ❑ The GoB is yet to develop any comprehensive policy to deal with internal migration.
- ❑ In 2006, the GoB framed an Overseas Employment Policy. However, the policy does not have any clause that deals with migration from climate change affected areas.
- ❑ The Nine-point Action Plan that it prepared made it mandatory for the recruiting agencies to recruit workers from *monga* and drought prone areas for international employment.

Programmes by Development partners

- ❑ Bilateral and multilateral agencies are deeply committed to climate change issue in Bangladesh
- ❑ Involved in aiding policy formulation, infrastructure development and community led adaptation programmes.
- ❑ Some programmes are **oblivious to migration** and others have conceptualised their intervention to **help people to stay in their places of origin.**

Can Migration Be Used as an Adaptation Tool?

- ❑ This research found that along with benefiting from local level interventions, some families have also used livelihood migration as one of the tools.
- ❑ Those families have gained more who combined local level livelihoods with livelihood migration of a few members of the household.
- ❑ Migration of household members provided better income and financial situation to migrants compared to non-migrants.

Can Migration Be Used as an Adaptation Tool? *Cont.*

Household Financial Situation in First and Present Dwellings

Migration Experience		Always Sufficient	Just Sufficient	Often Insufficient	Total Percentage
Migrant	first dwelling	6.1%	45.6%	48.3%	100.0%
	Present dwelling	10.9%	59.7%	29.5%	100.0%
Non-migrant	first dwelling	4.9%	52.1%	43.0%	100.0%
	Present dwelling	2.5%	46.6%	50.9%	100.0%

Can Migration Be Used as an Adaptation Tool? *Cont.*

- ❑ Before migration **6.1% of the migrants' economic status were “always sufficient”, currently it has increased to 10%.**
- ❑ **5% of the non-migrant belonged to “always sufficient” category but now it has reduced to 2.5%.**
- ❑ The number of persons in the category of “just sufficient” has also increased in case of migrant households but it has decreased in case of non-migrants.
- ❑ A number of households in occasional and chronic deficit have reduced in case of migrant households; whereas it increased in case of non-migrant households.
- ❑ A section of households which are trying to adapt only locally may **trap themselves into occasional or chronic poverty.**

Affected people's own strategy to adapt



Courtesy: Arjun Pandey, 24 Frames.

Men also migrate to work in rice mills of Khulna





RMMRU



RMMRU



RMMRU



Courtesy: Arjun Pandey, 24 Frames.

BRICK KILN WORKER



Courtesy: Arjun Pandey, 24 Frames.

Mahbub Sardar of Moddom Khoilsabunia used to work as a van puller in his village before Aila, now he works in a brickfield named 'Japani Itkhola' in Narayanganj for six months a year and earns Tk 75,000 . Another six months he stays with his family in the village. He mostly remains underemployed.

Conclusions

- ❑ Findings of this research necessitate **rethinking of policy framework** that treats migration as failure of adaptation.
- ❑ Adaptation programmes in Bangladesh should not set its goals to prevent migration as it hinders people's choice of mobility.
- ❑ While respecting the right of the affected people to stay put in places of origin, **policies should also respect the desire of those who would choose to migrate.**

Conclusions *cont.*

Such conceptualisation would throw new challenges:

- ❑ In case of **internal migration** focus on urban areas is warranted including planning for urban growth, connectivity between places, addressing protection gaps and mitigating social tensions.
- ❑ To access **short-term international migration** new types of interventions have to be designed at the local level.
- ❑ Opening of market-oriented human resource development centers, and establishing migration processing service providers' offices close to climate change affected areas.

Major Stakeholders for Policy Uptake

Adaptation programmes by three stakeholders:

- Government of Bangladesh
- Development Partners
- Civil Society Organisations (CSOs)/NGOs

Recommendations for GoB

❑ **Reconceptualisation of migration in different policies**

- Reorienting climate change related policies (such as NAPA, BCCSAP) that build upon migration.
- Policy focus on **voluntary migration as one of the many adaptation tools**.

❑ **Framing of Climate Change Policy**

- Framing of a climate change policy is important. Opportunity to bring in issues such as planning for urban growth centers.
- Proactive role in ensuring incorporation of migration in **UN sustainable development goals (SDGs)**.

Recommendations for GoB *cont.*

- ❑ **Overseas Employment Policy (2006) and Internal Migration Policy**
 - Incorporation of climate change issues in OEP (2006) to ensure access of people from climate stressed areas to short-term international contract migration.
 - Framing of an internal migration policy to protect the rights of internal migrants.

- ❑ **Inclusion of MOLE and MOEWOE in different CC committees**
 - Representation from MoLE and MOEWOE in CC committees, including the Inter-ministerial Climate Change Steering Committee, the Technical Committee of CCTF and the like.
 - Establishment of climate change focal points in these ministries.

Recommendations for GoB *cont.*

- ❑ **Allocation of CC funds for increasing access to migration**
 - Allocation for **development of urban growth centers** as well as satellite towns at the urban periphery for ensuring spaces, water, sanitation and other facilities to service providers – most of whom are internal migrants.
 - Investments in **transport infrastructure** that would enable workers to commute.
 - Allocation for establishing **international-market oriented technical training centers** in climate-change affected areas.
 - Ensuring greater access to Governments' migration service providing agencies such District Employment Office, Migrant Welfare Bank.

Recommendations for Development Partners (DP)

□ **Initiation of Evaluation of Policies**

- Reframing of specific sections of BCCSAP, NAPA, DRR which equated internal migration with crime or looked at migrants as welfare targets.
- Initiation of dialogues by EU & UK Aid for **incorporation of voluntary migration as an adaptation tool**.

□ **Coordination**

- Merging of **GFMD's migration development paradigm with migration-climate change discourse**.
- Migration issue to be strongly placed on **the "SDG" agenda**

Recommendations for Development Partners (DP) *cont.*

❑ **Market-oriented Human Resource Development**

- Facilitation of training and credit programmes through CDMP that support families to equip a few members to choose better livelihood opportunities through migration.
- Ensuring cohesion by SDC between its assistance towards international labour migration with its CC adaptation interventions.

❑ **Targeting Formal Sector Jobs**

- Encouragement for programmes that would equip potential internal migrants to avail formal sector jobs.

Recommendations for CSOs/NGOs.

Demand for Policy Reforms

- Demanding coherence among development, climate change and migration policies

Campaigns for Protection of Rights

- Organising campaigns for protection of rights of migrants.

Incorporation of Migration Services

- Incorporation of delivery of migration related services in NGOs' adaptation programmes at local level. They may also offer services in urban destinations.

Conducting Research

- More research by think-tanks to generate robust data on role of migration in climate change adaptation and urban planning.

Thank You

