International Migration
*Trends, determinants and policy effects*

Hein de Haas
heindehaas.org
International Migration
Trends, determinants and policy effects

Hein de Haas
University of Amsterdam, h.g.dehaas@uva.nl

Mathias Czaika
Danube University Krems, mathias.czaika@donau-uni.ac.at

Marie-Laurence Flahaux
University of Oxford, Institut de Recherche pour le Développement,
marie-laurence.flahaux@qeh.ox.ac.uk

Edo Mahendra
University of Oxford, edo.mahendra@wolfson.ox.ac.uk

Katharina Natter
University of Amsterdam, k.natter@uva.nl

Simona Vezzoli
University of Amsterdam, s.vezzoli@uva.nl

María Vilaress-Varela
University of Southampton, m.villaress-varela@soton.ac.uk

Paper 142, January 2018
DEMIG Paper 33

This paper is published by the International Migration Institute Network (IMIn). IMIn does not have an institutional view and does not aim to present one. The views expressed in this document are those of its independent author(s).
The determinants of international migration

* A theoretical and empirical assessment of policy, origin and destination effects

[www.imi-n.org](http://www.imi-n.org)

European Research Council (ERC)
2010-2014
EC’s Seventh Framework Programme
Support for Frontier Research
MADE
Migration as Development
How processes of development and social transformation shape human migration

European Research Council (ERC)
2015-2020
EC’s Seventh Framework Programme
Support for Frontier Research
DEMIG Databases

- **DEMIG C2C**: bilateral flows by country of residence (COR), citizenship (COC), birth (COB); 34 countries, 1946-2011, ≈50,000 dyads.

- **DEMIG TOTAL**: Total immigration, emigration and net migration, citizens and foreigners, 163 countries, from 1820.

- **DEMIG POLICY**: 6,500 migration policy changes, 45 countries, 1946-2013, coded by (i) policy area; (ii) policy tool; (iii) migrant category; (iv) geographical origin; also covers emigration policies.

- **DEMIG VISA**: Global panel (196*196 countries) of bilateral entry visa and exit permit requirements, full coverage 1973-2014.
International Migration Institute

www.imi-n.org

DEMIG data and DEMIG-IMI working papers
IN THIS SECTION

DEMIG data

- DEMIG C2C data
- DEMIG POLICY data
- DEMIG TOTAL data

EUMAGINE data

THEMIS data

DEMIG C2C data

The DEMIG C2C (country-to-country) database contains bilateral migration flow data for 34 reporting countries and from up to 236 countries over the 1946-2011 period. It includes data for inflows, outflows and net flows, respectively for citizens, foreigners and/or citizens and foreigners combined, depending on the reporting countries. The DEMIG C2C database was compiled through extensive data collection and digitalisation of historical national statistics as well as current electronic sources. It provides a unique opportunity to construct migration flows from many origin countries to the 34 reporting countries, as well as return flows.

DEMIG POLICY data

DEMIG POLICY tracks more than 8,500 migration policy changes enacted by 45 countries around the world mostly in the 1945-2013 period. The policy measures are coded according to the policy area and migrant group targeted, as well as the change in restrictiveness they introduce in the existing legal system. The database allows for both quantitative and qualitative research on the long-term evolution and effectiveness of migration policies.

DEMIG TOTAL data

DEMIG TOTAL reports immigration, emigration and net migration flows for up to 161 countries covering various periods of time from the early 1800s to 2011, disaggregating total flows of citizens and foreigners whenever possible. The database allows for quantitative analysis of the long-term evolution of international migration.
How effective are migration policies?
Between political claims making and migration realities
Research questions

1. What has been the nature and structure and evolution of global migration in the 1950-2010 period?

2. How can shifts in global migration patterns be explained from processes of development and social transformation in origin and destination countries?

3. What has been the nature and evolution of immigration and emigration policies in the 1950-2010 period?

4. What are the effects of migration policies and border regimes on the (i) volume, (ii) timing, (iii) duration, (iv) direction and (v) composition of migration?
1. Global migration trends
International migrants worldwide

Data sources: UN Population Division, Global Bilateral Migration Database © Hein de Haas 2015
International migrants
as a percentage of world population

Data sources: UN Population Division, Global Bilateral Migration Database
© Hein de Haas 2015
Neither exodus, nor invasion

So, what has changed?
1. Global migration trends
1. Global migration trends

- Global migration reversal
Figure 2. Estimated annual migration to Canada and USA by region of origin, 1950-2010

Source: DEMIG C2C Database
Figure 3. Estimated annual migration to Australia/New Zealand by region of origin, 1950-2010

Source: DEMIG C2C Database
Figure 1. *Estimated annual migration to EU15 countries* by region of origin, 1950-2008

Source: DEMIG C2C Database
Figure 5. Emigration from Africa to OECD destination countries, by region of origin, 1975-2010

Source: Flahaux and De Haas 2016, based on DEMIG C2C flow data
Figure 4. Women as percentage of total immigration, average of 28 reporting countries 1950-2009

Source: DEMIG C2C Database. Trend line: third order polynomial.
1. Global migration trends

• ‘Global migration reversal’
1. Global migration trends

- ‘Global migration reversal’
- Increasing concentration of migration
Figure 3. *Immigration Diversification Index Scores in 1960 and 2000*

Source: Czaika and de Haas 2014
1. Global migration trends

- ‘Global migration reversal’
- Growing concentration of migration in shrinking number of prime destinations
1. Global migration trends

• ‘Global migration reversal’
• Growing concentration of migration in shrinking number of prime destinations
• Decreasing circulation (?)
Asian migration to and from EU12

From Asia  
To Asia
South-Central American-Car migration to and from EU12

From South-Central Am and Caribbean
To South-Central Am and Caribbean
African migration to and from EU12

From Africa

To Africa

[Graph showing the number of African migrants to and from EU12 from 1953 to 2009, with a significant increase in the late 1990s and early 2000s.]
2. Migration determinants
Beyond ‘push-pull’

The need to reconceptualize migration as an *intrinsic* part of larger development processes
The developmental drivers of migration

The developmental drivers of migration

![Bar chart showing the percentage of population emigrating and immigrating across different human development index (HDI) levels.]

Migration transition theory

Micro

Development tends to initially increase people’s capabilities and aspirations to migrate
Micro
Development tends to initially increase people’s capabilities and aspirations to migrate

Macro
The increasing structural complexity of labour markets and increasing levels of educational and occupational specialization generate higher migration levels
2. Migration determinants

- Destination country labour demand and economic cycles
- Non-linear relation between development and emigration, but need to understand significant variations
- No significant effect of demographic factors on emigration
- International inequality is neither a sufficient nor a necessary condition for significant migration to occur
- Urban growth and international emigration are partly substitutes
- Ambiguous effect of political factors, environmental stress, education, and social welfare
3. The nature and evolution of migration policies

*Between rhetoric and practice*
Have migration policies really become more restrictive?
Have migration policies really become more restrictive?

‘Client politics’ (Freeman)
‘Embedded constraints’ (Hollifield)
Average yearly change in migration policy restrictiveness, 1900-2014

Figure 18 Aggregate policy changes, 1980-2014, Bars show changes in each year. The lines are the cumulative sums of changes. Source: own elaboration based on DEMIG data.
Source: DEMIG VISA database. See Marie-Laurence Flahaux and Hein de Haas (2014 forthcoming) Migration from, to and within Africa: The role of development and states. DEMIG Working Paper
Figure 13. Inbound entry visa restrictiveness, 1973–2013, averages by continent

Source: Czaika, de Haas, Villares-Varela 2017, based on DEMIG VISA data
Figure 14: Outbound entry visa restrictiveness, 1973–2013, averages by continent.

Source: Czaika, de Haas, Villares-Varela 2017, based on DEMIG VISA data.
Inbound visa restrictiveness, 2000s

3. Migration policy trends

- Immigration policies have generally liberalized
- Modern immigration policies are about selection rather than numbers (filters rather than taps)
- The general increase in migrant rights has coincided with attempts prevent the arrival of vulnerable migrant groups (through visa policies and border controls)
The effectiveness of migration policies
Are borders beyond control?
(Bhagwati 2003)
Are borders beyond control?

No, but

The capacity of policies to ‘steer’ migration is limited, and
Are borders beyond control?

No, but

The capacity of policies to ‘steer’ migration is limited, and

under certain circumstances, migration restrictions have unintended, sometimes counterproductive consequences, exposing fundamental policy dilemmas
‘Substitution effects’

Unintended consequences of immigration restrictions

‘Substitution effects’

Unintended consequences of immigration restrictions

1. Categorical substitution (category jumping)

‘Substitution effects’

Unintended consequences of immigration restrictions

1. Categorical substitution (category jumping)
2. Inter-temporal substitution
How the Dutch government stimulated unwanted migration from Suriname

How the Dutch government stimulated unwanted migration from Suriname

How the Dutch government stimulated unwanted migration from Suriname

How the Dutch government stimulated unwanted migration from Suriname

‘Substitution effects’

Unintended consequences of immigration restrictions

1. Categorical substitution (category jumping)
2. Inter-temporal substitution (‘now or never’ migration)

‘Substitution effects’

Unintended consequences of immigration restrictions

1. Categorical substitution (category jumping)
2. Inter-temporal substitution (‘now or never’ migration)
3. Reverse flow substitution (interrupting circulation)

Central policy dilemma:
Restrictions interrupt circulation and disrupt economic ‘elasticity’ of migration
‘Substitution effects’

Unintended consequences of immigration restrictions

1. Categorical substitution (category jumping)
2. Inter-temporal substitution (‘now or never’ migration)
3. Reverse flow substitution (interrupting circulation)

‘Substitution effects’

Unintended consequences of immigration restrictions

1. Categorical substitution (category jumping)
2. Inter-temporal substitution (‘now or never’ migration)
3. Reverse flow substitution (interrupting circulation)
4. Spatial substitution (spatial diversion, ‘balloon’ effects)

The conundrum of 25 years of ‘Fortress Europe’

- More migrant deaths
- Calls for intensified fight against people smuggling
- More anti-smuggling measures
- Smuggling under more dangerous conditions

Europe’s response
‘Substitution effects’

Unintended consequences of immigration restrictions

1. **Categorical substitution** (category jumping)
2. **Inter-temporal substitution** (‘now or never’ migration)
3. **Reverse flow substitution** (interrupting circulation)
4. **Spatial substitution** (spatial diversion, ‘waterbed’ effects)

When ill-conceived policies become counterproductive...
Moroccan emigration to OECD countries

DEMIG C2C database - www.imi.ox.ac.uk

Estimation de l'émigration basée sur les chiffres d'immigration des pays de destination:
FR, BE, NL, IT, ES, DE, DK, NO, FI, AT, CH, US, CA, AU
Ligne rouge = moyenne glissante sur 4 ans
Moroccan emigration to OECD countries

DEMIG C2C database - www.imi.ox.ac.uk

Estimation de l’émigration basée sur les chiffres d’immigration des pays de destination:
FR, BE, NL, IT, ES, DE, DK, NO, FI, AT, CH, US, CA, AU
Ligne rouge = moyenne glissante sur 4 ans
Moroccan emigration to OECD countries

DEMI C2C database - www.imi.ox.ac.uk
Estimation de l’émigration basée sur les chiffres d’immigration des pays de destination:
FR, BE, NL, IT, ES, DE, DK, NO, FI, AT, CH, US, CA, AU
Ligne rouge = moyenne glissante sur 4 ans
Geographical diversification of Moroccan migration

Source: DEMIG C2C database - www.imi.ox.ac.uk
Estimation des tendances basées sur une moyenne glissante sur 5 ans des statistiques d'immigration de FR, BE, NL, IT, ES, US, CA
Free and restricted migration dynamics

The three “Guyanas”
The migration control paradox

Percentage of population abroad

Source: Vezzoli 2015
The migration control paradox

Percentage of population abroad

Source: Vezzoli 2015
Final considerations

✧ Governments have a legitimate desire to regulate migration, but they need to look at *effectiveness*.

✧ Liberal immigration policies do not necessarily lead to mass migration and ill-conceived migration restrictions can be counterproductive.

✧ *Key policy dilemma:* wish to reduce inflows is difficult to reconcile with wish to encourage return and circulation.

✧ *Fundamental dilemma:* General trend towards economic liberalization seems at odds with the wish to curb immigration.

✧ Migration is driven by processes of development and social transformation that largely lie beyond the reach of migration policies.
International Migration Institute

www.imi-n.org

DEMIG data and IMI working papers